STUDIES OF THE DEPARTMENT OF AFRICAN LANGUAGES AND CULTURES

2008

NUMBER 42

Warsaw University

Warsaw University

STUDIES
OF THE DEPARTMENT
OF AFRICAN LANGUAGES
AND CULTURES

NUMBER 42

Contents

REVIEWS

FROM THE EDITORS

The purpose of this journal is to ensure the early publication of monographs and research work (source and analysis: bibliographies, maps, lexicographic studies, articles) carried out in the Department of African Languages and Cultures. Our Department is currently engaged in work in the fields of linguistics, literature, history and education in North-East, East and West Africa. The journal is primarily meant for disseminating works of the department staff. It starts to be open also for researchers from other centers of African studies who are somehow co-operating with us.

We believe that our work will be useful to specialists both in their own research work and in their teaching. This publication is not a commercial venture, and it is available only through exchange.

We shall be very grateful for all comments on the studies which we publish, for these will provide us with useful guidelines about the direction of our research and teaching.

Correspondence and offers of exchange should be addressed to:

Miłosława Stępień
University of Warsaw

Wole Ṣoyinka: Cultural Encounters
and *Death and the King's Horseman*

Resumé

Wole Ṣoyinka: La rencontre des civilisations, *La Mort et l'écuyer du roi**.

L'article est consacré à l'un des drames les plus controversés de Wole Ṣoyinka, *La mort et l'écuyer du roi*, mis sous le jour de ses textes critiques précoces ayant trait à la littérature africaine. *La mort et l'écuyer du roi* a connu une rude critique de la part de différents critiques africains pour sa langue par trop intellectuelle et pour sa complaisance excessive en tradition d'écriture européenne. Toutefois, il faut d'abord comprendre l'approche théorique que Ṣoyinka pratiquait vis-à-vis de la littérature affricaine, afin de pouvoir saisir les fondations de sa méthode d'écrire. Son mélange spécifique d'influences variées, depuis les chants d'éloge et d'une langue métaphorique propres à l'orature d'Yoruba, passant par les pièces shakespeariennes et la tradition du drame grec, est présenté ici comme un choix fait en toute conscience par un écrivain ayant atteint sa maturité et par un théoricien de la littérature disposant des connaissances immenses. Des travaux précoces de Ṣoyinka discutaient de différentes méthodes d'écrire pratiquées par une génération dite « première » d'écrivains africains, ce qui nous permet de dépister les motifs qui se dessinent derrière ses propres choix littéraires.

* édition française: Wole Soyinka, *La Mort et l'écuyer du roi*, Hatier International, Paris 2002, coll. Monde Noir

Wole Ṣoyinka, the only black African to have received the Nobel Prize in literature, remains one of the most controversial figures in the African literary world. The reasons for this are multiple: the complexity and sometimes elusiveness of some of his work, his critical approach to various aspects of African ideas on identity (specifically his criticism of Négritude and African primitivists), his political involvement in contemporary crises on the African continent (the

Biafran war in Nigeria, his engagement against the system of apartheid in South Africa or against Nigerian dictators, which resulted in long prison sentences, etc.). Ṣoyinka's highly intellectual literary works have found both staunch defenders and feisty critics, with many of his own essays devoted to the discussion of issues of African identity, often being direct commentaries and replies to criticism others had conducted of his style and approach to literature. Critics have commented on the language of his works (most typically attacking its complexity), the tropes he uses or the form and content of his works.[1]

Criticism of Ṣoyinka appeared quite early on with the staging in Nigeria in the early 1960's of his play *A Dance of the Forests*, which fuses elements of European modernism and Yoruba traditional theatre. It met with hostility from the Nigerian government who perceived it as critical of wide-spread government corruption, from literary critics for its 'elitist aesthetics' or the complexity of the play, and from what Ṣoyinka called the "Neo-Tarzanists" for having used European techniques. Yet often what is stated about Ṣoyinka has been shown to be a misreading or oversimplification of his undoubtedly complex approach to African literature. Ṣoyinka has written often on problems facing African writers and emphasized the right to freedom of expression and use of multiple sources of inspiration, without being forced within artificial limitations and categorisations. At the same time he has incorporated and drawn from the African (mostly Yoruba) theatrical tradition in an attempt to heighten awareness of its richness and complexity. What is most important for Ṣoyinka as a writer and critic is to not unwittingly allow mediocre or 'primitive' works to be considered as typical African writing – a danger he saw evolving from some black affirmation movements which often incorporated colonial stereotypes of the African into their world-view. This prolific essayist is often remembered for one short quotation against Négritude ("A tiger does not proclaim his tigritude, he pounces"), which does not do justice to the complexity

---

[1] The most staunch criticism of Ṣoyinka's style of writing came from Chinweizu et al. in the book *Toward the Decolonization for African Literature*. Vol. 1. Enugu: Fourth Dimension, 1980.

and richness of his literary and theoretical works. How then should we understand Ṣoyinka's literary texts in the context of his own writing about African literature? An appropriate place to begin this analysis would be with Ṣoyinka's critical texts dealing with the topic of various issues connected to writing by Africans and to compare these insights with one of his most controversial texts: *Death and the King's Horseman.*

1. Approaches to Issues of Identity in African Writing

Many of Ṣoyinka's early essays, such as "Cross-Currents: The 'New African' after Cultural Encounters'", "The External Encounter" or "From a Common Back Cloth", deal with the topic of African writing, critically analysing the underlying principles of various texts. In one of these early essays, "Cross-Currents" (1982), Ṣoyinka discusses various approaches African writers take when attempting to write about Africa from the perspective of post-independence times – against the back-drop of colonialism and cultural encounters with Arab-Islamic and European colonisers. He distinguishes between six categories. This is an interesting point to begin the discussion of Ṣoyinka's own texts, as it shows his intense interest in such topics and his self-awareness of choices made in the process of writing. The essay deals mostly with the so-called "first generation" of African writers from the 1950's and 1960's, who were characterised by an intense interest in issues of cultural encounters between African society and European colonialism. However, it would be justified to claim that Ṣoyinka should be perceived as a prodigy in that his criticism can be seen as sketching the path for future generations of writers who have shown themselves able to overcome, at least to a certain extent, the legacy of colonialism and begin writing in what Ṣoyinka saw as a liberated manner, where the African world-view is taken for granted as an element of global civilisation and where various methods and influences are used without the necessity to justify them. The essay was also written a couple of years after the publication of *Death and the King's Horseman* (1975) and shows an important phase of Ṣoyinka's philosophical development, which, though later underwent change, has in many ways shaped Ṣoyinka's views on African literature.

The first category of African writing dealing with cultural encounters, which Ṣoyinka calls 'ethnic submission', is explained on the basis of the text *Ambiguous Adventure* (1961) by the Senegalese writer, Cheikh Hamidou Kane. This category involves writing which shows the author does not seem to realise the outside influences that have invaded the African world: "[t]he author recognises his being and his society in no other terms than what is easily proven historically alien". ("Cross-Currents": 180) Such an approach entails the incorporation of foreign elements without any conscious realisation that they are not part of the local culture.

The second category, 'Négritude' or 'Cartesian response', involves the well-known black affirmation movement, most prominent amongst Francophone writers, such as Léopold Sédar Senghor, Aimé Césaire or Birago Diop. "To Descartes' 'I think, therefore I am', they responded on behalf of the black man: 'I feel, therefore I am'" ("Cross-Currents": 180). This manifesto of blackness was challenged by many critics, most notably by Ṣoyinka, in that it obviously incorporated a colonial framework of stereotypes about the African and allowed for their continued exclusion from rationality and, in some ways, from civilisation itself. By minimalising their involvement in world culture to that which is emotive and intuitive and affirming the idea of the black man as being one of dance and song but not technology, this approach, Ṣoyinka states, took "[…] refuge in glorifying the cultural retardation which has been assigned to them as their maximal development, turning it into a 'principled' aesthetic" ("The External Encounter": 236). Ṣoyinka's own criticism of Négritude seems to have been widely misunderstood, as he has often shown himself to be an admirer of the artistic talents of Senghor[2] or Aimé Césaire[3], but was more anxious about criticism which praised literature with no artistic merit[4], neo-Tarzanism[5] or primitivism.[6] He per-

---

[2] "Léopold Sédar Senghor is the true griot with a false vocation", cf. "The External Encounter": 237. Ṣoyinka thus appreciates Senghor's style of writing, but is critical of the ideology inherent in the texts.

[3] Ṣoyinka writes of Cesaire's "originality and craft", cf. "The External Encounter": 242.

[4] The essay "Neo-Tarzanism. The Poetics of Pseudo-Tradition" is a good

ceived at least some of the most notable 'Negritudinists' (his own term) as great writers who had chosen the wrong path. His criticism was directed more at misuse of Négritude philosophy, which allowed for facile romantisation and *naiveté* in choice of topics and poor writing. In recent times, Ṣoyinka has returned to the topic in his book *The Burden of Memory. The Muse of Forgiveness* (1999), where he analyses the reasons and motives standing behind the development of Négritude, which he here extols as an attempt to introduce "[...] a revaluation of neglected humanistic properties" (*The Burden*: 170) and a contestation of "[...] the combined hierarchies of their [Europeans'] materialist orientation on the one hand, and their spiritual ordering of the world on the other" (*The Burden*: 171). Thus, in a revision of Négritude, Ṣoyinka portrays it as perhaps not the perfect solution to the situation of that time, but understandable under the circumstances, retaining, however, his criticism of some primitivists' tendencies to praise literature of a low artistic level.

---

example of Ṣoyinka's views on the dangers of haphazard criticism. It discusses the criticism of the so-called 'decolonisers': Chinweizu, Onwuchekwa Jemie and Ihechukwu Madubuike (Ṣoyinka also refers to them as the troika critics), which he perceives as sloppy and harmful in that it raises poems on the level of nursery rhymes to being great poetry: "This trite, prosaic, coy, kindergarten drivel which my seven-year old daughter would be ashamed to write is extolled by the troika critics." ("Neo-Tarzanism": 320).

[5] Ṣoyinka most fully discusses Neo-Tarzanism in his essay of the same title, where he describes it using a quotation from Chinweizu's text "Prodigal's Come Home," *Okike* No. 4: "[...] a landscape of elephants, beggars, calabashes, serpents, pumpkins, baskets, town-criers, iron bells, slit drums, iron masks, hares, snakes, squirrels... *a landscape portrayed with native eyes to which aeroplanes appear as iron birds;* a landscape in which animals behave as they might behave in Africa of folk-lore, animals presented through native African eyes" ("Neo-Tarzanism": 315f., his italics). For Ṣoyinka this is a simplification and folklorisation of the African world and he rejects critical praise for such writing, calling it "an infantile regression" ("The External Encounter": 235).

[6] Primitivism is synonymous with Neo-Tarzanism in most of Ṣoyinka's early critical work (such as "The External Encounter", "From a Common Back Cloth" or "Neo-Tarzanism").

The very influential novel *Things Fall Apart* (1958) by another Nigerian author, Chinua Achebe, is the basis for Ṣoyinka's establishment of a third category of African writing: 'unmediated exposition'. The book shows an Igbo village at the moment when it encounters European civilisation for the very first time, faithfully portraying both the problems already existing in the pre-colonial African society and the conflicts which erupt when the alien culture begins to influence the local community. The narrator of the book does not however at any moment comment on the events or show his own perspective of them[7]. Both cultures are portrayed with a description of their negative and positive aspects and through this we gain access to information on various reasons why such different reactions appeared among various groups of both societies.

Ṣoyinka at this point introduces a sub-category of the second type of writing – 'Négritude', which he names 'stylistic bridges', giving Camara Laye's *Le Regard du roi* (1954) as an example. Ṣoyinka describes this category in his own words as: "First, black affirmation, next the synthesis of black leaven and white flour – humanism and technology – which would create a new, progressive brotherhood or being" ("Cross-Currents": 180f.). It is described as a category which attempts to recover black authenticity through universalisation of the topic, achieved through a filtering of ethnic content. Notably, Camara Laye's text ends with affirmation of the cultural value of African social structures and the strength flowing from such structures of society.

As contrast to the category of 'ethnic submission' and as a step further taken than the other categories, Ṣoyinka shows a fifth grouping of African literature which he places under the heading of 'iconoclasm'. As examples he gives texts, which were published at a much later time than the previously mentioned: Yambo Ouologuem's *Le Devoir de violence* (1968) and the writing of Ayi Kwei Armah (especially *Two Thousand Seasons*, 1973). Ṣoyinka describes this category as including the works of rejectionists: those, who did not allow for a romantisation of any culture and portrayed history as all

---

[7] For Ṣoyinka's discussion of Chinua Achebe's writing see: "Cross-Currents": 180; "From a Common Back Cloth": 11-13.

civilisations being on a "violent course of collision" ("Cross-Currents": 182). It was thus both against the claims of imperialist colonial powers about their cultural superiority and a denial of Négritude romantisation of the power of traditional society. Ṣoyinka criticises such an approach as being "blanket iconoclasm [...] an undialectical proceeding on a par with blanket fetishisation of myth and history" ("The External Encounter": 243). Armah, unlike Ouologuem, did attempt to portray the positive values of traditional society, yet Ṣoyinka perceives *Two Thousand Seasons* as falling into the "[...] pitfalls of the simplistic, through this evocation of an authentic tradition" ("Cross-Currents": 182). As contrast to this category, the father of African cinema and one of Africa's greatest writers, Ousmane Sembene, earned a separate mention in Ṣoyinka's list. His text *Les Bouts de bois de Dieu* (1960) is described as: "[...] committed to a rejection of sentimentality in tradition, it nevertheless results in the triumph of the strengths of the positive in tradition" ("Cross-Currents": 182), which Ṣoyinka portrays as a greater achievement as it avoided the pitfalls of complete self-negation, something the iconoclasts could not avoid.

This introduction into Ṣoyinka's early essays on African literature shows much about his own views on what African literature should be and what dangers it must be careful to avoid – ideas, which had an enormous impact on his own works. The criticism of Ṣoyinka's 'elitist aesthetics' and use of foreign influences in his writing must necessarily be countered with an explication of his views on this topic. In the essay "Neo-Tarzanism. The Poetics of Pseudo-Tradition" (1975) Ṣoyinka conducts a vivid description of the dangers of allowing African art to be portrayed as simplistic and primitive. Being well-versed not only in the Western classics, from Greek tragedy, through Shakespeare, to the great modernist experimentalists, but also in the intricacies of the Yoruba oratory tradition, Ṣoyinka is in the best position to draw comparisons and show the discrepancies of approaches which allow for claims that Africa has nothing to offer to the world in this area, except for 'emotive' writing. Ṣoyinka shows examples of how Hopkins' "sprung rhythm" has been known in traditional Yoruba poetry for a long time, discusses the intricacies of the polyrhythmic musical tradition or the symbolic and metaphysical levels of contemporary Afri-

can poetry, all in order to counter the claim that his own writing is not African due to its complexity. Ṣoyinka perceived the African world-view and cultural input into global culture as aspects which should not have to be justified and which should allow for a fluid and liberal use of other influences, similarly as European artists have drawn upon aspects of world culture, often without even rudimentary knowledge of their meanings, to enhance their own artistic expression (such as the European surrealists).

2. *Death and the King's Horseman*

Death and the King's Horseman (1975) is at once the most appropriate and inappropriate of Ṣoyinka's texts to discuss when interested in the topic of cultural encounters between African society and the colonisers. It tells the story of an incident which "[…] took place in Oyo, ancient Yoruba city of Nigeria, in 1946" (*Death*, Author's Note, 3), involving a local custom whereby the Chief's horseman was obliged to commit suicide exactly a month after the leader's death. The local colonial police-officer, Pilkings, takes it upon himself to stop this "barbaric custom" (*Death*: 43), which leads to tragedy. This is one of Ṣoyinka's few plays directly dealing with the topic of cultural encounters between traditional society and that of the colonialists. However, at the same time, Ṣoyinka in the author's note to the American edition of the play emphasizes that *Death and the King's Horseman* should not be read simplistically under the "[…] facile tag of 'clash of cultures'" and he goes on further to comment that the "Colonial Factor is an incident, a catalytic incident merely" (*Death*, Author's Note, 3).

The climactic moment in *Death and the King's Horseman* has been the subject of much speculation as the most superficial reading of it would involve a comparison with Achebe's *Things Fall Apart* – the most widely known African book on culture clashes[8]. Pilkings interruption of the ritual of passage should, however, be read in the context of other factors, pointed at in the text itself. Elesin Oba, the

---

[8] Achebe's *Things Fall Apart* also ends in tragedy with the dishonourable suicidal death of the main character, who cannot reconcile his own life with the changes slowly being brought about by colonial administration.

King's horseman, has been preparing for the ritual of death, but had that same day decided to go against customary behaviour and take a young wife, earlier promised to his own son, to sweeten his passage to the other world. Iyaloya, leader of the women from the market[9], criticises this decision, predicting that this will bring about unforeseen circumstances as it is obviously an affirmation of life and a sign of the Horseman's tie to earthly pleasures, when Elesin should be preparing for death. Thus, Pilkings' interference with the ritual is perceived by the local community simply as a convenient escape for Elesin, as he had been immersing himself in the sweetness of life and was himself reluctant to fulfil his accepted duty. Elesin tries to lay the blame on the colonialist: "My will was squelched in the spittle of an alien race" (*Death*: 57), but Iyaloya, who comes to visit him in prison where he is being kept in order to stop the suicide from taking place, comments:

> I warned you, if you must leave a seed behind[10], be sure it is not tainted with the curses of the world. Who are you to open a new life when you dared not open the door to a new existence[11]? I say who are you to make so bold? (*Death*: 55)

Thus, Ṣoyinka, both in the text and in the author's notes to it, is leading us to the interpretation that the cultural clash in this context is nothing more than a scapegoat to allow Elesin to escape a fate he had chosen for himself, yet obviously without fully embracing all the consequences, in accordance with custom when he had taken on the function of the chief's companion, a function which had involved an honourable place in society and special benefits and treatment throughout his life.

---

[9] The market in Ṣoyinka's play fulfils a double function. It introduces the local people and their everyday life and at the same time it is suggestive of the Yoruba saying: "The world is a marketplace (we visit), the otherworld is home" (Quoted in "The Yoruba World": 72), which suggests a more metaphysical level of symbolism.

[10] Reference to Elesin's wedding night and his having impregnated his young wife on the eve of the ritual of death.

[11] Reference to the passage into the next world.

The difficulties of these cultural encounters are, however, present in other ways in the text, especially in the dialogues conducted between Pilkings and his wife, Jane, often in the presence of their servants, where they show their paternalistic attitude towards the local population and their lack of understanding of its workings. Such comments as Jane's statements: "I thought all bush drumming sounded the same" (*Death*: 21), their donning of the sacred *Egungun* costume for a masquerade at the colonial residency (an affront to the holy character of the masks as part of local ritual) and a conversation conducted in front of Joseph their servant, in which, oblivious of his presence, Pilkings states that on the one hand "these natives" will disclose even their family secrets at the earliest opportunity, while on the other, they are "sly, devious bastards" (*Death*: 23), show how little they even try to understand of the culture they have been living next to for so many years and how they do not treat Africans as equals. They also do not understand how converts to Islam or Christianity can still hold respect for such sacred symbols as the *Egungun* masks, when Amusa, one of the local police-officers and a Moslem, does not agree to speak with them when they are wearing the costumes.

The most interesting exchange, however, is between Jane and Olunde, Elesin's son, whom the Pilkings had helped to send to England for medical studies against the wishes of his father, who had hoped that as oldest son he would continue in his footsteps as King's Horseman. Olunde had returned that day for his father's funeral as he had known from the moment of receiving information about the King's death of the impending ritual suicide. Jane seems to have expected Olunde, after experiencing Western education, to have repudiated his ties to local customs and is surprised when he criticises her for wearing the ancestor's mask simply to impress the English prince attending the ball that day and states that one thing he had discovered during his studies is that: "[...] you [the British] have no respect for that what you do not understand" (*Death*: 41). Ṣoyinka has met with some criticism of his stereotypical portrayal of the British in this text, yet, it would seem justified to state that the Pilkings are sketched here more as typical colonialists as background for the choices the main characters of the play make. The play ends with the death of both Olunde, who takes it upon himself to fulfil his father's

role after the latter's failure to do so, and Elesin, who hangs himself on his chains upon seeing his son's body laid before him.

Language is another playground upon which questions of cultural encounters can be shown to be important. The issue of choice of language in African writing has long been a contested one: from calls to introduce one of the African languages, usually Kiswahili, as the language of the continent (Ṣoyinka proposed this himself in the essay "Langauge as Boundary"), through choices made to write in local languages (the Kenyan Ngugi wa Thiong'o began to write in Kikuyu after having published some of his works in English), to subversive games played with the language of the colonisers. Ṣoyinka's works have met with criticism due to the complexity of the language used. One of the play's most interesting features is the incorporation of various registers of language (Queen's English, stylised Yoruba praise-singing, Pidgin English, standard text book English, etc.) and of elements of Yoruba mythology and metaphors. The most linguistically complex, and, for the European audience, most difficult to fully understand, fragments involve exchanges between Elesin Oba - the King's horseman, Olohun-Iyo - the praise-singer, and the chorus of women from the marketplace. These parts of the text are written with the use of traditional forms of dialogue, with many references to Yoruba cosmology and the use of direct translations of Yoruba metaphors and sayings, all of which make some fragments of the text extremely elusive for European audiences. As an example the following fragment will suffice:

> ELESIN: When the horse sniffs the stable does he not strain at the bridle? The market is the long-suffering home of my spirit and the women are packing to go. The Eṣu[12]-harrassed day slipped into the stew-pot while we feasted. We ate it up with the rest of the meat. I have neglected my women (*Death*: 5).

---

[12] Eṣu – "The Yoruba trickster god often associated with doubleness, ambivalence, duplicity" (*Death*, footnote 5)

In order to fully understand this fragment, it would be necessary to know that the market-place is also symbolic of the living world in Yoruba culture and women here indicate also worldly pleasures of the flesh, important in the context of Elesin's choice to marry on the eve of his death. Eṣu, as a trickster god, here entails that the day has slipped past, as if they had been tricked into wiling his last day away. Metaphors of food play an important role in the text: the King's Horseman has dined with the chief throughout his life and they will go on to the Next World for new feasts, yet when Elesin does not go through with the ritual, Iyaloya tells him that he prefers to "[…] fight [...] for the left-overs of the world" instead of choosing an honourable after-life in the world of the ancestors, he has opted to hold on to pleasures which are no longer his due.

Pilkings, his wife and Olunde converse in the proper standard English, while Pidgin English is introduced in the speech of Amusa, the police-officer under the command of Pilkings, who first brings him news of the planned ritual suicide. One of the most comic fragments of the play involves a scene between Amusa, who has come to arrest Elesin, and the market women, who do not want to allow him to enter the chamber where he is spending his wedding night with his new wife. Amusa is frustrated: "Iyalola, make you tell dese women make den no insult me again. If I hear dat kin' insult once more..." (*Death*: 29), to which the young girls, probably educated in local missionary schools, react with ridicule by mimicking "the white man" (*Death*: 32):

> GIRL [...] –What's your handicap old chap?
>   –Is there racing by golly?
>   –Splendid golf course, you'll like it.
>   –I'm beginning to like it already
>   –And a European club, exclusive.
>   –You've kept the flag flying.
>   –We do our best for the old country.
>   –It's a pleasure to serve.
>   –Another whisky old chap?
>   –You are indeed too too kind.
>   –Not at all Sir. Where is that boy? [With a sudden
> bellow.] Sergeant!
> AMUSA [snaps to attention] Yessir!
>   (*Death*: 31)

This exchange, which ends with Amusa making a fool of himself, finally wins the day for the women, who force Amusa and his policemen to leave. It is also a vivid commentary on the function of language: Amusa, who is estranged from his own culture due to having chosen to side with the colonisers, at the same time has not been able to gain mastery of their language for which he is also looked down upon by the whites, while for the young girls – language is used to manipulate Amusa, it is a convention they have learned and are capable of using subversively.

Ṣoyinka himself has often explored the cultural richness and complexity of traditional African (often Yoruba) art forms, using elements in his literary works and discussing them in his critical works, through which he had hoped to challenge racist ideas of the simplicity of the African oral tradition. In *Death and the King's Horseman* we find conventions and idioms taken from Yoruba traditional and popular drama and such elements as music, dance and song, customs connected to masks and African sayings and proverbs play an important part. On the other hand, Ṣoyinka's works have been criticised for being over-intellectualised and elitist, which is only partially true as he has written both extremely difficult and linguistically challenging texts and worked with popular theatrical groups in Nigeria which performed using elements of dance, song, mime and Pidgin English (e.g. Unlimited Liability Company).

However, it is impossible to understand Ṣoyinka's works without looking towards other influences that have gone into the creation of his style of writing. Ṣoyinka was well versed with the works of Shakespeare, having studied under the famous scholar G. Wilson Knight, it is also possible to trace the influence of experimental modern playwrights such as Beckett, Brecht or O'Neill on his work, as well as that of Greek tragedy[13]. Patrick Chabal adequately sums

---

[13] For a discussion of the influence of Greek tragedy on *Death and the King's Horseman* cf: Henry Louis Gates, Jr. "Being, the Will, and the Semantics of Death", *Death and the King's Horseman*, 155-164; other influences apparent in the works of Ṣoyinka are discussed in most introductory texts to his works.

up that Wole Ṣoyinka's "[...] work is at once utterly modern in the Western sense but also fundamentally African in both inspiration and artistic sensibility" ("The African Crisis": 4). What Ṣoyinka in fact proposes is that the African tradition no longer be perceived as simply of anthropological interest and as being folkloristic and static, but as a living and growing input into world civilisation, no longer burdened with colonial stereotypes and the weight of constantly countering them, allowing it to finally enter the global stage on equal footing. Ṣoyinka opened the door to this stage for future writers, such as Ben Okri, Chimamanda Adichie or Yvonne Vera, through his artistic and critical works, so that for them the words below are obvious and no longer need to be stated:

> I cannot claim a transparency of communication even from the sculpture, music and poetry of my own people the Yoruba, but the aesthetic matrix is the fount of my own creative inspiration; it influences my critical response to the creation of other cultures and validates selective eclecticism as the right of every productive being, scientist or artist. Ṣango is today's god of electricity, not of white-man magic-light, Ogun is today's god of precision technology, oil rigs and space rockets, not a benighted rustic cowering at the iron bird ("Neo-Tarzanism": 329).

Thus Ṣango, the Yoruba god of lightening and thunder, or Ogun, the god of fire and war, are shown to be mythical tropes, the meaning of which can change with time – it is not an idea which should become a symbol of static concepts of Africanness, especially anthropological accounts of what 'authentic' Africa is.[14] They become part of the fluid cultural 'matrix' that African writers can draw upon in their writing, yet allowing at the same time for finding inspiration in a myriad of other concepts, ideas and styles from around the world.

---

[14] Interestingly enough both Ṣango and Ogun become symbols of resistance against European colonisation.

Bibliography:

Appiah, A., 2003, "Wole Soyinka and the Myth of the African World", in: Ṣoyinka, W., 2003, *Death and the King's Horseman. Authoritative text. Backgrounds and Contexts. Criticism*, ed. by Simon Gikandi, New York: Norton and Company, 103-112.

Asante-Darko, K., 1998, "Discourse, tradition, and power in a literary transition", *Mots Pluriel*, 8. October 1998, http://www.arts.uwa.edu.au/MotsPluriels/MP898kad.html.

Chabal, P., 1996, "The African Crisis: Context and Interpretation", in: ed. by Richard Werbner and Terence Ranger, *Postcolonial Identities in Africa*, London – New Jersey: Zed Books.

Drewal, H.J., J. Pemberton III & R. Abiodun., 2003, "The Yoruba World", in: Ṣoyinka, W., *Death and the King's Horseman. Authoritative text. Backgrounds and Contexts. Criticism*, ed. by Simon Gikandi, New York: Norton and Company, 67-73.

Gates Jr., H.L., 2003, "Being, the Will, and the Semantics of Death", in: Ṣoyinka, W., *Death and the King's Horseman. Authoritative text. Backgrounds and Contexts. Criticism*, ed. by Simon Gikandi, New York: Norton and Company, 155-164.

Gikandi, S., 2003, "Introduction" [to]: Ṣoyinka, W., *Death and the King's Horseman. Authoritative text. Backgrounds and Contexts. Criticism*, ed. by Simon Gikandi, New York: Norton and Company, vii-xxiv.

Jeyifo, B., 1988, "Introduction. Wole Ṣoyinka and the Tropes of Disalienation", in: Ṣoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, viii-xxxii.

Şoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press.

Id., 1993, *The Blackman and the Veil: A Century On. Beyond the Berlin Wall. Lectures delivered by Wole Şoyinka on 31st August and 31st September 1990,* s.l.: Sedco Publishing and W.E.B. Du Bois Memorial Centre for Pan-African Culture.

Id. 1999, *The Burden of Memory. The Muse of Forgiveness,* Oxford: Oxford UP.

Id., 1988, "Cross-Currents: The 'New African' after Cultural Encounters'", in: Şoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, 179-189.

Id., 1988, "Drama and the African World-View", in: Şoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, 37-60.

Id., 2003, *Death and the King's Horseman. Authoritative Text. Backgrounds and Contexts. Criticism,* ed. by Simon Gikandi, New York: Norton and Company.

Id., 1988, "The External Encounter: Ambivalence in African Arts and Literature", in: Şoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, 221-246.

Id., 1988, "From a Common Back Cloth. A Reassessment of the African Literary Image", in: Şoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, 7-14.

Id., 1988, "Language as Boundary", in: Şoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, 132-145.

Id., 1999, "L.S. Senghor and Négritude: *J'accuse, mais je pardonne*", in: Ṣoyinka, W., 1999, *The Burden of Memory. The Muse of Forgiveness,* Oxford: Oxford UP, 93-144.

Id., 1976, *Myth, Literature and the African World*, Cambridge: Cambridge UP.

Id., 1999, "Négritude and the Gods of Equity", in: Ṣoyinka, W., 1999, *The Burden of Memory. The Muse of Forgiveness,* Oxford: Oxford UP., 145-194.

Id., 1988, "Neo-Tarzanism. The Poetics of Pseudo-Tradition", in: Ṣoyinka, W., 1988, *Art, Dialogue & Outrage. Essays on Literature and Culture,* ed. by B. Jeyifo, Ibadan: New Horn Press, 313-329.

Id., and Beier, U., 1992, *Wole Ṣoyinka on "Identity". From a Conversation with Ulli Beier,* Bayreuth: University of Bayreuth, Iwalewa House.

Miłosława Stępień
University of Warsaw

Truth – a Different Form of Justice?
Antjie Krog's *Country of my Skull*

Resumé

La vérité, est-elle une forme différente de la justice? Antjie Krog *La Douleur des mots**

Un livre d'Antjie Krog *La Douleur des mots* est devenu l'un des plus importants livres qui soit publié en RSA après apartheid parce qu'il tente de pénetrer, en détails et avec exactitude, dans les coulisses des activités de la Commission Vérité et Réconciliation. Bien que *La Douleur des mots* exploite largement de pièces juridiques originaux, il n'est pas une simple relation qui décrit ce qui s'est produit, mais c'est aussi un texte postmoderniste comportant également des éléments de la fiction, une auto-analyse metatextuelle d'un processus d'écrire sur la vérité et une analyse perspicace des fondations philosophiques et sociales de la Commission Vérité et Réconciliation.

Le présent article commence par une présentation de différentes conceptions de vérité et de justice présentes au sein même de la Commission Vérité et Réconciliation pour présenter la complexité de ses fondations et les contradictions intrinsèques de celles-ci. Le livre d'Antjie Krog, mis dans ce contexte, est présenté comme ouvrage réflétant les questionnements et problèmes existant à l'intérieur de la Comission. Par ailleurs, ses expériences narratives variées font adhérer la voix de Krog dans un débat: comment écrire sur la vérité, avant tout sur celle d'un passé aussi trempé de douleur et d'injustice que le passé de la RSA du temps de l'apartheid.

* édition française: Antjie Krog, *La Douleur des mots*, Actes Sud, Arles 2004

It will sometimes be necessary to choose between truth and justice. We should choose truth, he says. Truth does not bring back the dead, but releases them from silence.

Antjie Krog, *Country of my Skull. Guilt, Sorrow, and the Limits of Forgiveness in the New South Africa*, New York, Three Rivers Press: 1998: 32.[1]

I have told many lies in this book about the truth.

Antjie Krog, op. cit., 388.

But what about truth – and whose truth?

TRC Report. Vol. 1, ch. 5, para. 29.

Abbreviations used in citing sources:
[Act] – Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act, No. 34 of 1995.
[TRC] – Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report.

According to Antjie Krog's *Country of my Skull*, part of José Zalaquett's advice before the instigation of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa was that it would "sometimes be necessary to choose between truth and justice." [Krog: 32] Truth commissions mark an important stage in recent history, where it was required that differing forms of quasi-legal courts be implemented to deal with specific situations of human rights violations: ones in which retributive justice was exchanged for truth and a necessary political compromise: amnesty. This initial quote introduces us to the questions which I perceive as the driving force behind Antjie Krog's book: questions of whether truth becomes a substitute for justice in the case of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission or whether truth and justice are mutually reconcilable if

---

[1] This quote appears without quotation marks in the book, but is attributed in the text to José Zalaquett, who served on the Chilean National Truth and Reconciliation Commission and took part in a conference about the TRC in South Africa before it was established.

justice is redefined and conceptualized differently? To answer these questions, Krog struggles throughout the book to find a way to conceptualize both 'truth' and 'justice.' In her attempt to come to terms with the history of her country, her own people's involvement in the implementation of apartheid, and the ways in which this past was dealt with within the context of the TRC, Krog battles with the limitations of narrative itself, self-consciously asking the question: how do you write about the 'truth', what is 'truth' and is it accessible through narrative. However, the most pressing question in the context of the complex ways in which 'truth' was conceptualized within the TRC itself, is whether this choice of truth over justice was successful: did the 'truths' which came out during the proceedings of the TRC and in the report published after its completion really achieve their goal? On some levels, Antjie Krog's *Country of my Skull* can be considered as an alternative TRC report, one which deals with very similar issues and also tries to come to terms with these various kinds of 'truths'. It was published in 1998, soon after the TRC in South Africa ended and closely follows the proceedings of this Commission, often directly citing real testimonies, while also discussing social, historical, political, and philosophical issues connected to its existence. What makes the book interesting is how it mirrors the same questions that became significant in connection to how the TRC functioned, how it was perceived by South Africans and influenced the construction of a new national identity.

1. The Truth and Reconciliation Commission: Truth vs Justice?

Truth commissions in general tend to be introduced as political compromises within peaceful transitions, thus they function as a practical means with which on the one hand to deal with past human rights abuses, while at the same time, through offering amnesty to perpetrators, they are often the only acceptable form of legal proceedings for members of the previous regime. This has been the basis for many controversies as political necessities are prioritized, according to critics of such commissions, over a sense of justice being served, especially as truth commissions are often established in countries with a history of extreme atrocities committed, such as South Africa's apartheid system, Rwanda's mass genocide, or Chilean political disappearances and oppressive military regime. They

thus stand in stark contrast to post-II World War trials, such as Nurnberg-type trials, which aimed at punishing the perpetrators, yet it is important to note that these proceedings based on concepts of retributive justice took place in a context of the complete military defeat of the previous regime by outside powers and thus political compromises were not necessary to enable transition.[2]

The transition from the apartheid era to the new South Africa was wrought with a variety of problems that entailed the introduction of very specific institutional and rhetorical tools, meant to aid the process of entering a new form of nationhood. This proved to be very difficult due to the specific way in which the historical changes in South Africa were introduced. Similarly to the Polish round-table talks at the turn of the 90's, where the end of socialism was decided upon by members of both the previous government and the rebelling solidarity members, the ANC and the government of South Africa of that time, under the leadership of Mandela and de Klerk, came to the decision to leave behind apartheid and enter upon a new road.[3] The agreement reached led to the 1994 first fully democratic elections in the history of South Africa, in which every person, regardless of skin color, was able to participate in the voting process; the passing of a new constitution in 1996, considered by many to be one of the most progressive in the world; and the installation of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission with its hearings and amnesty-granting procedures, which in total lasted from 1996 to 2001. These three events are broadly considered to be the milestones of the transition period in South Africa and as such have become major elements of the ways in which 'the New South Africa' conceptualizes itself.

---

[2] For an in-depth analysis of truth commissions around the world and various criticism connected to their implementation see: Priscilla Hayner, *Unspeakable Truths: Facing the Challenges of Truth Commission,* Routledge: New York 2002.

[3] For a detailed account of the historical context of the TRC see: Johnny de Lange "The historical context, legal origins and philosophical foundation of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission": 14-21; Margriet de Ruiter, *Imagining the Past*, 21-53.

Even though the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa was not the first of its kind, it has certainly become one of the most discussed, due mostly to its scope and magnitude, the complex ways in which it functioned and conceptualized its own aims, its upheld utopian goal of bringing nation-wide reconciliation and the controversies it has sparked among philosophers and theoreticians on the concepts of truth and justice. The South African TRC was largely based upon the proceedings of the Chilean version of such commissions, which had begun its proceedings in 1991. Act No. 34 of 1995, the Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act, established the TRC's main objectives [section 3(1) of the enabling legislation] as the gaining of as complete a knowledge as possible of the causes, nature and extent of human rights violations, which had been carried out in South Africa between 1 March 1960 and 8 October 1990/6 December 1993.[4] This was to be achieved through the holding of hearings and conducting investigations into specific cases. The TRC would be able to grant amnesty to perpetrators as long as they made a full disclosure of crimes committed during the apartheid era and if these acts were perceived as being carried out in order to fulfill a political objective. Additionally, the TRC was meant to grant victims "[...] an opportunity to relate their own accounts of the violations of which they were victims" [Act: 3(1) (c)], which would allow for a recommendation of reparations awarded to them. The final objective of the Commission was the compilation of a report, which would provide "[...] as comprehensive an account as possible of the activities and findings of the Commission ... and which contains recommendations of measures to prevent future violations of human rights." [Act: 3(1) (d)] The Act established three committees which were to function independently: The Human Rights Violations

---

[4] The initial cut-off date established in the 1995 Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act was supposed to be in accordance with the one suggested in Chapter 16 of the Interim Constitution (the final clause on National Unity and Reconciliation) – after 8 October 1990 and before 6 December 1993, but, due to various political pressures, the TRC later extended the cut-off date to 10 May 1994.

Committee (public hearings with victims and survivors of viola-
tions), the Amnesty Committee (amnesty applications) and the Repa-
rations and Rehabilitation Committee (formulating policies which
were meant to help the victims).

In contrast to other truth commissions, the South African ver-
sion was the first to be established through a democratic parliamen-
tary act and it also introduced various solutions, which were not used
in other such institutions. Among the most important differences are:
the majority of hearings were held publicly and with wide media-
coverage; broad subpoena, search and seizure powers; a sophisti-
cated witness protection program; its comparatively large staff size
and budget, etc. Additionally, the process of amnesty was individual-
ized, unlike blanket amnesty offered in most other commissions,
which meant that the TRC had a significantly larger amount of per-
petrators giving evidence.[5] Johnny de Lange in his article on the
TRC notes that the South African Commission actually took a third
path between two opposing models for approaching violations in
transitional situations: the first being the 'justice model' – based on
concepts of prosecution and punishment, broadly termed as retribu-
tive justice; the second: the 'reconciliation model' used in various
truth commissions, in which blanket amnesty was a typical element
that placed it in direct contrast to the first type of model. Through the
introduction of an individualized amnesty-granting process and the
public character of the hearings, the South African TRC can be
claimed to have introduced a form of the "social justice model", in
that the deeds would be punished through being made publicly
known and having the perpetrators face their own past crimes [de
Lange 15f.].

Inherently, the Truth and Reconciliation Commission dealt
with very significant problems on the level of self-definition, as on
the one hand it was a type of court meant to establish facts connected
to human rights abuses in the past, on the other, it lacked the power
to administer justice - in the generally used sense of retributive jus-

---

[5] For a detailed description of the specific character of the South African
TRC in comparison with various Truth Commissions around the world see:
Priscilla Hayner. "Same species, different animal", 32-41.

tice. Thus, in a typical court, the attempt to find the truth is a means to achieve an aim: evidence is gathered in order to enable a decision about the guilt or innocence of the suspect and to establish the severity and length of the sentence. In the TRC, truth became an aim in and of itself: unknown elements of the past were to be uncovered, victims (and perpetrators) were to be given a forum for telling their stories and on this basis collective memory of the atrocities of apartheid was to be established and national reconciliation achieved. The 'Post-Amble' to the 1993 Interim Constitution, i.e. the final clause on National Unity and Reconciliation, adequately states the purpose of the TRC in the words of Lourens du Plessis: "[...] for the sake of reconciliation we must forgive, but for the sake of reconstruction we dare not forget,"[6] thus showing the double objective of the TRC.

Due to the specific character of such a court, at least four different types of truth were written into the proceedings, which in many ways found themselves to be in direct conflict with each other. The TRC explicitly distinguishes between four different senses of truth:

1. *factual or forensic truth*;
2. *personal or narrative truth*;
3. *social or dialogue truth*;
4. *healing or restorative truth.*[7]

These various concepts of truth were a direct outcome of the various objectives the TRC was meant to achieve as discussed in the previous paragraphs. Factual or forensic truth is most closely connected to the traditional role of a court of justice as it is mostly interested in the issue of the practical and functional establishment of the facts surrounding a case, defined in the TRC report as the "familiar

---

[6] Qtd in A. Boraine et al., *Dealing with the Past*, Cape Town: IDASA 1994, 109.
[7] Originally in the *TRC Report*, Vol. 1, Ch. 5, 'Concepts and Principles', 30–45. Discussed further in: A. du Toit, "Experiments with Truth and Justice in South Africa: Stockenström, Gandhi and the TRC", 439–41; A. Sachs, "Different Kinds of Truth: The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission", 52-55; D. Posel, "The TRC Report. What Kind of History? What Kind of Truth?", 154-157.

legal or scientific notion of bringing to light factual, corroborated evidence, of obtaining accurate information through reliable (impartial, objective) procedures" (TRC 1.5.32-33) thus it is an attempt at reaching an 'objective' and 'universal' version of truth based on hard evidence. As discussed by Deborah Posel in her article "The TRC Report. What Kind of History? What Kind of Truth?" the other types of truths were introduced in order to accommodate the acknowledgement in the Commission's mandate of the possibility of subjective constructions of history [Posel: 154]. Personal or narrative truth in the context of the TRC involved every person having the right of voice to tell his/her own story. In the case of the TRC it was a possibility for both victims and perpetrators to tell their versions of what happened. Thus it was interested in concepts of individual truth, memory (and the inaccessibility of traumatic memory) and the subjective perspective, experience and even myth. Social or dialogue truth is to be perceived as an attempt to reach a new version of national collective memory or history that would be accepted as the standard version of what happened during apartheid: "the truth of experience that is established through interaction, discussion and debate" (TRC 1.5. 39). Thus the TRC report became a way in which the commission hearings were standardized through selection and prioritization into an official version of South African history, while simultaneously taking into account the multiplicity of voices heard. This is also connected to the aim of creating a master narrative for future nation-building. Healing or restorative truth can be connected both on the personal and national level with psychoanalysis and religious ideas of truth bringing about healing of personal traumas and reconciling the nation, most generally symbolized by the motto of the TRC hearings: "The truth shall set you free"[8]. This concept sees truth in absolutist and divine terms, yet at the same time focuses on its practical function as a means to enable the transition from apartheid to a new 'rainbow' nation. This element of the TRC was strongly enforced by the Commission's chairman, archbishop Desmond Tutu.

---

[8] This motto was present at all TRC hearings on banners hanging above the Commission.

These various types of 'truth' underlie the contradictory nature of the TRC's aims, which were on the one hand to create an open-ended patchwork of narratives about South Africa's past through the incorporation of a multitude of previously silenced and sometimes juxtaposed voices into the narrative (mirroring a more relative concept of what 'truth' is) and, on the other, to create collective memory, which would function as an official history of apartheid and would become the basis for national reconciliation ('truth' as representation of reality). As Meg Samuelson notes, the end reports of the TRC are an example of how these paradoxical aims were not fully resolved until the very end of the Commission's functioning, where at one point it admits that the story it is portraying "[…] is not and cannot be the whole story" (TRC 1.1.5), while simultaneously wanting "[…] to close the chapter on our past." (TRC 1.1.93.) [Samuelson: 64]. The TRC report itself acknowledges this conflict when asking the unanswerable question: "But what about truth – and whose truth?" (TRC 1.5.29). Consequently, these concepts of truth, as observed by Colin Bundy, use two divergent notions of historical knowledge: one emphasizing the necessary incompleteness and constructive nature of various versions of the past in line with contemporary post-structural thought, the other based on a more traditional view that history can be objectively portrayed and there must necessarily become an official, acknowledged, 'real' and factual version of what happened [Bundy: 13]. Both approaches are, however, extremely suspect in a country within which 50 years of apartheid enforced censorship, extensive propaganda and misinformation, as well as institutionalized denial of the reality of systematic state violence. More relative approaches to history carry the danger of undermining the real violence experienced, as an emphasis on the impossibility of representing the past allows for a return to denial that these events actually took place. Shane Graham in his essay "The Truth Commission and Post-Apartheid Literature in South Africa" points out that Krog, who leans towards a more complex post-structural idea of 'truth', "[…] embraces a conception of truth that threatens to play into the hands of the very right-wing forces who wish to cover up the crimes of the past under a convenient veil of relativism" [Graham: 21]. While, at the same time, the creation of a master narrative of apartheid history is necessarily selective, excluding and marginali-

zing as it prioritizes certain versions of that past. Additionally, such an approach sidelines issues of the complexities of traumatic memory, subjective experience of violence and narrative issues connected to the impossibility of fully rendering such a past. A dry 'objective' account of historical events does not necessarily come closer to describing these events as it excludes the subjective voice of those who experienced the events. If 'truth' was chosen as a different form of justice, was the objective truly achieved if such disparate concepts of 'truth' were incorporated into the very workings of the Commission?

2. Truth in Antjie Krog's *Country of My Skull*

While the TRC report attempted to incorporate all these kinds of truth into the voluminous 2, 700-page text, Antjie Krog's *Country of My Skull* constitutes an attempt to come to terms not only with the issue of truth on the level of what took place within the context of the TRC, but also on the level of narrative itself. The book should be considered exemplary of a postmodern text, where fictional stories, metatextual autoanalysis of the process of writing, and fragments of real testimony, TRC documents and interviews are incorporated into a complex text which seems to ask: what is truth and what is truth's function? The narrator of the story is at the same time the author, Antjie Samuel as a journalist, making the book into something between an autobiographical or journalistic account of the TRC, Antjie Krog as the poetic persona, and a fictional character, allowing for the incorporation of completely fictional elements into the plot, such as the narrator's extramarital affair.[9] *Country of my Skull* ends with a two-page acknowledgements chapter in which Krog writes: "I have told many lies about the truth" [Krog: 338], which seems to summarize many of the issues the author was dealing with in the process of writing the book. The many metatextual musings on the nature of truth and (im)possibility of narrative renderings of that 'truth' are replicated on the formal level of the text through various experiments with narrative methods of introducing TRC testimonies: with or

---

[9] Antjie Samuel is the pseudonym Antjie Krog used when covering the TRC proceedings. This and the fictionality of the love affair are mentioned in the critical review of the book by Claudia Braude "Elusive Truths" published in the South African *Mail and Guardian* in June 1998.

without commentary and background information; verse-like structuring of certain utterances; by giving additional information on translation problems or descriptions of the witness's appearance and behavior; and using interpretative strategies of narration recognizable from literary studies. These all could be categorized within various genres or styles of writing, which complicate issues of subjectivity/objectivity, agency and the possibility of representation of 'reality', especially in the case of traumatic memories. Thus, *Country of my Skull* also becomes a journey into questions of what literature is and how it functions. On another level, Krog also echoes Theodor Adorno's concerns of whether it is still possible to write poetry in the wake of such barbarity as Auschwitz:

> No poetry should come forth from this. May my hand fall off if I write this. So I sit around. Naturally and unnaturally without words. Stunned by the knowledge of the price people have paid for their words. If I write this, I exploit and betray. If I don't, I die. [Krog: 66]

Thus, for Krog writing the book is at the same time the exploitation of victim narratives and memories, while being a necessity in order to come to terms with this past. Krog finds herself struggling with questions of how apartheid can be written about and what issues come to play when literature begins to deal with the subject of an institutionalized system of violence and injustice. For Krog, the novel is a journey by which she traverses through the past of her country and her own people's involvement in the creation of the apartheid state and through which she attempts to find her own place within that context. It is about her coming to terms with what happened, which she finds possible only through listening to the voices of those who had been previously silenced and then by giving them space to speak once again in her novel.

Antjie Krog's experiments with various methods of incorporating witness testimonies into the book exemplify her own difficulties with finding a way to write about the 'truth' of apartheid, mirroring the issues with this topic inherent in the TRC itself. Whole fragments of *Country of my Skull* are direct quotations from TRC testimonies, which are incorporated into the general text in various ways. Initially

she begins with placing fragments of testimonies into the text without specifying the name of the witness presenting these narratives [Krog: 39-42]. This anonymity of the victims can suggest an initial attempt at universalizing the experience of violence, thus emphasizing the multitude of voices which are yet to come. However, Shane Graham reads this chapter of the book as making the witnesses into "interchangeable metaphors" [Graham: 25], which indicates that the victims of violence are somehow removed from their own stories, destroying their agency and in some regards denying them the subjective context of these narratives as utterances of personal experience. Further on, Krog usually at least adds the name of the person whose testimony is given in parentheses at the end of the fragment, while sometimes also adding additional background information about the narrator: journalistic-style descriptions of the events before giving the words of the victim (e.g. Mrs Mathlili's testimony [Krog 48-50]); character and personal background descriptions similar to those found in novels, seemingly by a third-person 'omniscient' narrator (e.g. description of Dirk Coetzee [Krog 79-83]); or additional descriptions of the witnesses' behavior, clothes, demeanor (an interesting example is the way Krog focuses and comments on the clothes and method of speaking of the rape and torture victim, Rita Mazibuko [Krog 240-242]). The use of such disparate narrative strategies mirror debates within literary studies on the functions and methods of literature when attempting to represent 'reality' or the 'truth' about the world. A journalistic-style account, listing facts, dates, names, necessarily omits the subjective perspective of the persons involved, while sometimes giving 'interesting' details to make the story more heart-rending and accessible to readers, listeners or viewers. Krog discusses this when she writes about the methods in which radio sound-bites, due in part to time limitations, are created to focus on a "fantastic testimony", a "sexy subject" or "nice audible crying" [Krog: 45]. On the other hand, a description of background information pertaining to a certain person is based on choices made by the author of what information is prioritized or selected, thus, while giving a semblance of being 'objective', it actually manipulates an external subjective narrative perspective within the limitations of a specific genre of writing, one which we are taught to read in a certain way according to the norms of literature.

Yet, a complete exclusion of such narrative methods and limiting the story only to the specific words spoken is by no means more revealing, especially as testimonies are a type of performance, where the timbre of the voice, gestures, facial mimicry, movements and clothing play an important role in how we perceive and interpret the narrative event.[10]

Krog herself quotes Roland Barthes words: "Narrative does not show, does not intimate ... [Its] function is not to represent, it is to constitute spectacle" [Krog 103]. Krog is very much conscious of these issues as she experiments with various ways of writing about what happened at the TRC, showing how in fact disparate versions of the events were given through varying narrative methods, undermining the possibility of representing 'reality'. In a few instances in the book, she introduces various versions of the same event, which emphasize the metatextual and intertextual character of the book. Directly after quoting Barthes, she introduces a number of versions of the Mutase killings: three contradictory testimonial accounts by the three perpetrators of the crime (all attempting to avoid responsibility for the killings), a fictional description from the novel by John Miles *Kroniek uit die doofpot*, and a journalistic account from the *Sowetan* which had been incorporated into Miles's novel. Additionally, Krog builds another level of interpreting these disparate versions of the same story by introducing academic discussions of oral narratives or analyses of the specific ways in which each of the narratives was presented and the psychological motivations behind the various versions of events [Krog: 103-119]. This conscious acknowledgement of the variety of ways in which a single event can be narrated, depending, on the one hand, on the motivations, psychological state of mind, consciously or unconsciously selective memory of events (in the case of the perpetrators' testimonies) and, on the other,

---

[10] Shoshana Felman in her essay "A Ghost in the House of Justice: Death and the Language of Law" bases her entire discussion of the Eichmann trial on a moment when testimonial narrative actually broke down and the witness, K. Zetnik, fainted, unable to continue. This discussion is interesting in that it shows how narrative can be found also in the absence of narrative *per se*, in moments when language is no longer possible, for example in cases where traumatic memory causes a disruption in the ability to use words.

the narrative context itself (a journalistic account, a fictional description, oral (performative) narration), returns us to the question of 'truth': whose 'truth' do we accept as the 'Truth'? And is it even necessary for the 'Truth' to be established?

This debate about different concepts of truth is echoed in the exchange between the narrator of the book and her husband to whom she admits that she has had an affair. The husband suggests they hold an amnesty hearing during which she could confess and the lover would be called upon to confirm the facts. She answers: "It is useless to talk about the truth. My whole telling of what happened will be driven forward, determined, trimmed, slanted, by my desire not to hurt you, to entice you back, to protect your honor, and to convince you to exonerate me" [Krog: 262]. These words bring us back to the motivations behind the varying versions of the perpetrators' testimonies in the Mutase killings; however, the husband's answer seems to close the debate: "Rubbish. There is always a basic truth: you cheated on me" [Krog: 262]. What Krog seems to be saying is that even though the narratives we hear may vary and may be dependent on additional factors which influence the way they are presented and what information is included or excluded, the underlying aspect of an event having occurred will be confirmed by it having been brought to light. In the last pages of the novel Krog acknowledges the greatest achievement of the TRC as having "[…] made space for all of our voices" [Krog: 364], an objective which Krog mirrors in her own book through the incorporation of so many different testimonies and through the use of an extensive variety of narrative methods.

"What about the truth – and whose truth?" asked the TRC report. If we are to consider the TRC as a type of "social justice model", in accordance with de Lange's analysis, as deeds being punished through their being made publicly known and having the perpetrators face their own past crimes, the example of the Mutase hearings to a large extent seems to fall short of this idea. If we accommodate the post-structural idea that narrative constitutes not representation of reality, not factual/forensic truth about what happened, but a spectacle, a multi-faceted, disparate, variable and often conflicting variety of versions of the events, are the deeds then actually publicly known and have the perpetrators faced their crimes? Krog seems to answer this question in her own way: "If [the TRC's]

interest in truth is linked only to amnesty and compensation, then it will have chosen not truth, but justice. If it sees truth as the widest possible compilation of people's perceptions, stories, myths, and experiences, it will have chosen to restore memory and foster a new humanity, and perhaps that is justice in its deepest sense" [Krog: 21f.]. Whether the TRC has actually managed to administer a type of justice through its objective of "[...] the establishment of as complete a picture as possible of the nature, causes and extent of human rights" [Act: Preamble] will remain a debatable question, one which philosophers, historians, sociologists, lawyers, writers, and literary theorists will continue to discuss for years to come, adding to the already extensive amount of conflicting narratives on the subject.

Bibliography:

Braude, C., 1998, "Elusive Truths", *Mail and Guardian* [Johannesburg] 12-18 June, 9.

Boraine, A. et al., 1994, *Dealing with the Past*, Cape Town: IDASA.

Brink, A., 2005, "Stories of History: Reimagining the Past in Post-Apartheid Narrative", in: Nutall, S., and Coetzee, C. (eds), 2005, *Negotiating the Past: The Making of Memory in South Africa,* Oxford: Oxford UP, 29-42.

Bundy, C., 2000, "The Beast of the Past: History and the TRC", in: James, W., van de Vijver, L. (eds), 2000, *After the TRC: Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa*, Cape Town: David Phillip, 9-20.

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (Act 200 of 1993) – Interim constitution, 1994-1996. Available: http://www.info.gov.za/documents/constitution/93cons.htm

Enwezor, O. et al. (eds), 2002, *Documenta 11 Platform 2. Experiments with Truth*, Ostfildern-Ruit: Hatje Cantz Publishers.

Felman, S., 2000, "A Ghost in the House of Justice: Death and the Language of the Law", in: Felman, S. (ed.), 2000, *The Juridical Unconscious. Trials and Traumas in the Twentieth Century,* Cambridge: Harvard UP, 131-166.

Id., 2000, *The Juridical Unconscious. Trials and Traumas in the Twentieth Century,* Cambridge: Harvard UP.

Graham, S., 2003, "The Truth Commission and Post-Apartheid Literature in South Africa", *Research in African Literatures*, 34, 1, 11-30.

Grunebaum-Ralph, H., 2001, "Re-Placing Pasts, Forgetting Presents: Narrative, Place, and Memory in the Time of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission", *Research in African Literature*, 32, 3, 198-212.

Hayner, P., 2000, "Same Species, Different Animal: How South Africa Compares to Truth Commissions Worldwide", in: Villa-Vicencio, C., Verwoerd, W. (eds), 2000, *Looking Back, Reaching Forward. Reflections on the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa,* Cape Town: Cape Town UP, 32-41.

Id., 2002, *Unspeakable Truths: Facing the Challenges of Truth Commission,.* Routledge: New York.

James, W., L. van de Vijver (eds), 2000, *After the TRC: Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa*, Cape Town: David Phillip.

Jolly, R., 2004, "Spectral Presences: Narrating Women in the Context of South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission", *Canadian Journal of African Studies*, 38, 3, 622-637.

Krog, A., 1998, *Country of my Skull. Guilt, Sorrow, and the Limits of Forgiveness in the New South Africa*, New York: Three Rivers Press.

Lange, J. de., 2000, "The Historical Context, Legal Origins and Philosophical Foundation of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission", in: Villa-Vicencio, C., Verwoerd, W. (eds), 2000, *Looking Back, Reaching Forward. Reflections on the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa,* Cape Town: Cape Town UP, 14-31.

Margalit, A., 2002, "Is Truth the Road to Reconciliation", in: Enwezor, O. et al. (eds), 2002, *Documenta 11 Platform 2. Experiments with Truth*, Ostfildern-Ruit: Hatje Cantz Publishers, 61-64.

Moss, L., 2006, "'Nice Audible Crying': Editions, Testimonies, and *Country of My Skull*", *Research in African Literatures*, 37, 4, 85-104.

Nutall, S., and Coetzee, C., (eds) 2005, *Negotiating the Past: The Making of Memory in South Africa,* Oxford: Oxford UP.

Posel, D., 2002, "The TRC Report. What Kind of History? What Kind of Truth?", in: Id. and Simpson, G. (eds), 2002, *Commissioning the Past. Understanding South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, Johannesburg: Witwatersrand UP., 147-172.

Id., Simpson, G. (eds), 2002, *Commissioning the Past. Understanding South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, Johannesburg: Witwatersrand UP.

Id., Simpson G., 2002, "Introduction. The Power of Truth. South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission in Context", in: Posel, D., Simpson, G. (eds), 2002, *Commissioning the Past. Understanding South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, Johannesburg: Witwatersrand UP, 1-36.

Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act, No. 34 of 1995. Available: http://www.doj.gov.za/trc/legal/act9534.htm

Ruiter, M. de., 2003, *Imagining the Past. The Impact of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa on History-writing and Collective Memory*, Unpublished thesis, Institute of History, University of Utrecht.

Sachs, A., 2002, "Different Kinds of Truth: The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission", in: Enwezor, O. et al. (eds), 2002, *Documenta 11 Platform 2. Experiments with Truth*, Ostfildern-Ruit: Hatje Cantz Publishers, 43-60.

Samuelson, M., 2003, "Cracked Vases and Untidy Seams: Narrative Structure and Closure in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission and South African Fiction", *Current Writing* 15, 2, 63-76.

Toit, A. du., 2005, "Experiments with Truth and Justice in South Africa: Stockenström, Gandhi and the TRC", *Journal of Southern African Studies* 31, 2, 419-448.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa. *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report.*
All volumes available at website:
http://www.doj.gov.za/trc/trc_frameset.htm

Villa-Vicencio, C., W. Verwoerd (eds), 2000, *Looking Back, Reaching Forward. Reflections on the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa,* Cape Town: Cape Town UP.

Aleksandra Bukowska

Israeli and Jewish Institutional Reactions to the Falasha Immigration after 2004

Resumé

Réactions des institutions israéliennes et juives à l'immigration des Falashas après 2004

La fin de l'année 2004 constitue une étape importante dans l'histoire de l'immigration des Falashas en Israël. Les membres du Knesset adressèrent alors au premier ministre Ariel Sharon une pétition dans laquelle ils demandaient l'accélération de l'accueil des Juifs éthiopiens et de leur insertion dans la société israélienne. On y postulait l'augmentation du quota d'immigration des Falashas de 300 à 1000, ou au moins à 600 personnes par mois. En février 2005 un groupe spécial fut formé, réunissant entre autres les ministres de l'intégration, des finances et des affaires étrangères, qui avait pour but de surveiller l'observation des critères permettant l'installation en Israël. Malgré les efforts entrepris pour abréger les procédures de vérification et pour établir un plan qui permettrait d'achever le processus d'immigration en 2 ou 3 ans, celui-ci se prolonge jusqu'à ce jour. Le présent article décrit les différentes causes de cet état de choses : l'instrumentalisation du problème des Falashas dans la politique intérieure courante, les difficultés de conversion au judaïsme, la résistance des chefs religieux orthotoxes, les difficultés d'adaptation des immigrés dans la société israélienne (p.ex. la formation de ghettos noirs scolaires et religieux), la vision stéréotypée des Juifs noirs etc. On y présente aussi la réaction des organisations juives internationales à la politique discriminatoire du gouverment israélien vis à vis des Falashas dans le contexte de son attitude envers les immigrés venant d'Europe et de l'Amérique.

1. Acceleration of the Falasha Immigration to Israel

The end of 2004 marks a new stage in the history of the Falasha. At that time 61 Knesset members signed a petition which was sent to the Prime Minister Ariel Sharon, demanding acceleration in the process of bringing the Falasha to Israel[1]. In this letter the parliamentarians demanded the rejection of the policy of "allocations and numbers" and postulated the increase in the amount of the Falash Murah coming to Israel from 300 to 1000, or at least 600 people per month. It was one of the main postulates of the Jewish organisations as well as that of the Immigration and Absorption Committee of the Knesset. The petition was handed to the Prime Minister Ariel Sharon the day before the planned discussion on this topic with the participation of all the relevant state organisations and institutions. However, it turned out that the discussion was postponed. The reason for this was the change of personnel in the position of the Minister of Interior and the Minister of Absorption. Thus, the planned demonstrations organised by the Ethiopian Jews who already lived in Israel, were called off. In a statement issued by the Ministry of Interior one could read that the system of gradual bringing of the Falash Murah to Israel would not be changed.

However, in the beginning of February 2005, the Israeli government decided that by the end of 2007 there would be some 20,000 Falasha brought to Israel[2]. A special unit was created, which included ministers for immigration, treasury and foreign affairs. Its task was to investigate whether applicants for the immigrant status had the proper entitlement. Origin and religion were two main criteria permitting them to settle down in Israel. Prime Minister Sharon expected that within a period of three or four weeks there would be sketched detailed plans of receiving and absorbing the next groups of the immigrants.

The above mentioned issue of *Haaretz* states that from 1999 on some 15,000 Falasha have been living in camps in the vicinity of Addis-Ababa and Gondar and waiting for the "complete repatriation to Israel". It should be remembered that in 2003, upon the decision of the government, all those who had Jewish mothers were allowed to come to Israel. At that time the legal entitlement to the Israeli citizenship was also verified. The decision taken by Ariel Sharon's government allowed an increase in the membership of the special unit which was responsible for

---

[1] *Haaretz*, 23-12-2004.
[2] *Haaretz*, 01-02-2005.

proper leadership of the verification process and for the accomplishment of this process even within 2 months, if possible. It was also decided to double every month the number of the Falasha who underwent this verification process, from 300 to 600 people.

The decision was met with enthusiasm from the Falasha who were already residing in Israel. However, A. Ngose, head of the organisation called *MeKanaf Drom LeZion* when referring to the government's decision expressed his disappointment that it was not decided to finalise the process and to bring all the remaining Falash Murah still awaiting in Ethiopia. In the opinion of Tzipi Livni, then Minister of Absorption, the decision was very important as it should have initiated significant budget changes and led to some extra funds made available for the preparation of a proper absorption process. The decision was also welcomed by Zionist organisations not only in Israel but also, among others, in the USA. Unfortunately, the decision has never been put into effect.

According to the statistical data of the Ministry of Absorption, in June 2005, when the decision was due to become law, 300 Falash Murah arrived in Israel: in July 303, in August 302 and in September 440.

On October 30, 2005, in front of the Prime Minister's Office in Jerusalem there was a demonstration whose participants demanded that all the Jews should be allowed to come to the Jewish State[3]. This appeal referred mostly to the Ethiopian Jews. As stated above, eight months earlier Ariel Sharon decided to increase the monthly rate of the Falasha coming to Israel. This was a response to the pressure from the Jewish circles, including the Chief Sephardic Rabbi, as well as from some international personalities, for example from the former Canadian Minister of Justice. The most important target of the decision was the will to shorten the time of the immigration procedure. When the decision was taken there were still some 18,000 Falash Murah waiting in the camps or living in villages in Ethiopia. Initially, the operation was planned to end in 6 years' time. By doubling the monthly immigration rate of the Falash Murah to 600 souls this period would be shortened to 2-3 years. In the face of the drastically worsening living conditions in Ethiopia (poverty, famine, and AIDS epidemic) the implementation of the decision had a key meaning. It should be remembered that in February 2003, it was

---

[3] "Let my people in!" Supplement to *The Jerusalem Post*, 02-11-2005.

Sharon's government that decided to bring all the Falasha from Ethiopia. Why now they did not want to fulfil their promises?

Professor Shlomo Mayaan from the Hadassah University in Jerusalem is of opinion that the people waiting many years in the camps, or persons individually applying (as it happened in the Gondar region) for the verification process, and for obtaining the immigrant status, which could enable them coming to Israel, are three times more vulnerable to AIDS than those waiting only one year or less. Maayan's research has shown that among those who waited for departure to Israel for less than one year only 2,3% were infected with the HIV virus. Among those who waited up to two years – 2,8% were infected. However, in the case of those whose verification process lasted three years or more the number increased up to 10,2%. The problem is important as most people waiting in camps eventually come to Israel and only there do they start the treatment process. This causes an increased number of infected people in Israel and requires greater financial means for medical services in the country. Research led by Professor Maayan showed that 6,3% of women and 5,8% of men, who are newcomers from Ethiopia, happened to be HIV positive.

A change in the bureaucratic verification system could bring a solution to this problem. It would be much safer to lead verification procedures in the villages without the necessity to stay long in poor sanitary conditions in the camps, in which – according to the statistic data – some 20,000 Falasha continue to live.

Sources close to the Ministry of Absorption excused the delay in the implementation of the government's decision with the unstable interior situation in Ethiopia. However, it should be kept in mind that the election in that country was held in May 2005, and won by Meles Zenawi, so there was no change in the Ethiopian politics. In November 2005, the Israeli media informed the public that after completing his fact-finding mission, the Director General for Africa in the Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs described the interior situation in Ethiopia as "stable". The result of this positive evaluation was that the Minister of Foreign Affairs, S. Shalom, together with the representatives of the Ethiopian Government decided to resume the repatriation of the Falasha to Israel at a rate of 600 souls per month. Under the pressure from the demonstrations mentioned above, Minister Shalom

declared also that the whole process of bringing the black Jews to Israel should be completed by the end of 2007 or at the beginning of 2008. This situation gave a new vigour to the activities of the Zionist organisations and aid agencies. The renewed action to take the Ethiopian Jews to Israel was called "Operation Jonah" referring thus to the Biblical prophet as well as to Jonah Bogale, the Jewish leader from Ethiopia in times of the "Operation Moses".

2. Campaign to Improve the Image of the Falasha

Governmental institutions started a social campaign to improve the image of the Ethiopians in the eyes of the Israeli public, the cost of which was estimated at 1,3 million shekels. This campaign started on the 30th anniversary of the beginning of *aliyah* from the countries of Eastern Africa[4]. It was believed that during the campaign there would be a series of press articles and television programmes presenting the Ethiopian success stories. The aim of such action was not only to change the image of the Falasha but also to contribute towards the improved integration of the Ethiopian immigrant communities into the Israeli society. The decision to embark on this campaign was brought about by the difficulties faced by the Ethiopian immigrants when they wanted to become full citizens of Israel. This view was shared by Tzipi Livni, Minister of Foreign Affairs, who at the same time was responsible for the Ministry of Absorption. Zeev Bielski, head of the Jewish Agency, supported this opinion by reasoning that the engagement of State and society should not be stopped on a day when 100,000 Ethiopian immigrants have already come to a new homeland.

Icchak Dessie, head of the Tebeka Centre, highlighted that the recent image of the Ethiopian immigrants in the eyes of the Israeli public was totally negative. This campaign was necessary as there was a clear need for a positive perception. However, he was not sure as to whether this campaign would solve all the Falash Murah's problems. In his opinion it was most important for Ethiopians to attain high and influential positions in the society. According to the Tebeka data, 60% of Falasha with a university degree were unable to

---

[4] *The Jerusalem Post*, 14-02-2006.

find a job corresponding to their level of education. The majority of them were forced to accept blue-collar jobs such as security guards.

Jacob Ben Shimon, Deputy Mayor of Petach Tikva and one of the organisers of the Empowerment for Ethiopian Youth programme explains that the difficulties encountered by the Ethiopian immigrants to Israel are caused by the fact that these immigrants, as opposed to other immigrant groups, come from a culture which does not encourage or promote education.[5] According to statistics of the Municipality of Petach Tikva, in 2006 out of 700 Ethiopian families only 9 young people attended high school. From general statistics[6] it can be deduced that only 17,7% of the Ethiopian students complete their high school education at the University entry level compared with 48% of the entire population, and 19% of the Falash Mura finish high school education at all compared with 50% of the population at large.

A similar programme of educational encouragement for young Ethiopians has been initiated by the University of Tel Aviv. Within the framework of the Thinking Science Programme graduates of the University meet the local Falash Murah community, encourage young people to continue their education and provide them support lessons in Hebrew, English and Mathematics.

Dov Ohayon, Regional Director in the Ministry of Absorption, considers the situation of the Ethiopians in Israel to be very difficult. Within the first 2-3 years they not only have to learn a new language, but also, in the majority of cases, complete the process of conversion, find a job and a place to live. That is why a proper education could ease their adaptation, in both the social and professional environments.

Unfortunately, situations often arise when the conversion process is denied through the religious authorities. It happens so in cases when the Ethiopian students attend secular classes. This was the case of a group of 40 students of Jezreel Valley College. When justifying their decision the argument put forward by the Rabbinical Court was that the Sabbath was not observed in the dormitories where the stu-

---

[5] *Metro*. Supplement to *The Jerusalem Post*, 03-03-2006.
[6] *Central Bureau of Statistics Bulletin*, 2003.

dents lived. According to the opinion of some activists from the absorption organisations, the religious authorities maintain a very hostile policy towards the immigrants who cannot obtain the Israeli citizenship without receiving a certificate of completion of the conversion process. The newspaper *Haaretz*[7] published statistics according to which out of 181 young Ethiopians who had completed preparatory courses for conversion in period from the beginning of 2005 until April 2006 only one person received the certificate of completion. Interviews with young Falash Murah show that servants of the Rabbinical Courts controlled the lifestyle and living conditions of the new immigrants by, for example, reproaching them for not observing prayer times and not accepting the fact that secular duties do not allow them to pray three times a day.

As a result of the decision taken by the Chief Sephardic Rabbi, S. Amar, who recommends to accept the Falasha as full Jews on condition they complete the process of "returning to Judaism", many schools and courses were established to assist and prepare the Ethiopian immigrants to undergo this process. One of these courses was *Kedma* ("Moving Forward") led by the Jewish Agency for the conversion process. The course organisers also admit that the policy of the Rabbinical Courts displays a hostile attitude towards the Ethiopian Jews, treating them *a priori* as harbouring negative feelings towards their new homeland. However, activists of the Jewish Agency explain that this lack of enthusiasm for the Jewish life among young Falasha is fully understandable because they live in limbo for years without receiving any confirmation that they are suitable to become citizens of the State of Israel. In spite of the fact that the preparatory course for the conversion process was extended from 10 to 12 months (as desired by the religious courts), full readiness of the participants of these courses for conversion is being questioned. Many politicians (including M. Melchior from the Labour Party) and social activists put the blame for failure of the conversion system on the rabbinical servants. These servants claim that the small number of immigrants obtaining the conversion certificates is a result of the lack of the budget allocation for their proper preparation.

---

[7] *Haaretz* 27-04-2006.

During operations Moses and Solomon many Ethiopians were brought to Israel in accordance with the law aimed at uniting the immigrants' families. This situation necessitated a great deal of bureaucracy. Those who were responsible for the formalities shared the opinion that this bureaucracy created a false impression among the Falasha concerning their new life in Israel. This referred to a straightforward and unproblematic adaptation to life in a new country, and to a false sense of acceptance and being part of the new society. The counter argument to this was that the Falasha themselves did not give a true account of their life in Ethiopia, and most of all they did not reveal their true reasons for coming to Israel. They could not explain how close they were to the Jewish religion and culture. There were many cases where newcomers gave false information concerning personal details and their family situation in order to satisfy the Israeli authorities.

Falasha immigration to Israel has been backed by all Zionist organisations, particularly those in the USA. On the way to their new homeland the immigrants encounter many obstacles such as the absorption costs and especially the question of who is entitled to receive the new immigrant status[8]. 300 Ethiopian immigrants coming to Israel every month receive the Israeli citizenship. They are entitled to a course in Hebrew and 90% of the new accommodations' costs. This leads to a conviction that the Falasha were coming to Israel for purely economic reasons. Subsequently, there would be a non-stop stream of the Ethiopian immigrants to Israel. This was undoubtedly one of the reasons behind the decision to freeze plans aimed at bringing all the Falash Murah to Israel by the end of 2007. The disappearance from the political arena of Ariel Sharon, the main architect of those plans, did not help the situation.

---

[8] *The Jerusalem Post*, 21-02-2006.

As stated above, the Ethiopian immigration to Israel has been strongly supported by the USA activists who in this particular wave of the *aliyah* see the essence of Zionism. This immigration has also a humanitarian aspect and fulfils the need for social justice, which is particularly popular among the younger generation of its supporters. On the turn of 2005, a group of leaders of the American-Jewish organisations, mainly from the United-Jewish Communities, visited Ethiopia on several different occasions. As a result of one of those visits "Operation Promise"[9] was started in February 2006, the aim of which was to provide 160 million USD worth of aid to the most needy. Of this amount, 100 million was meant to be allocated to the Ethiopian *aliyah* and the remaining 60 million to the elderly people, particularly those coming from the former USSR.

3. Criticism of the Governmental and Institutional Actions towards the Falasha

Representatives of the absorption organisations, who studied the Falasha's situation before they had arrived in Israel, claimed that the Israeli government did not assign enough funds for the preparation of the new immigrants for living in Israel. In such a way the government contributed to creation of the "generation of parasites".[10] In the opinion of the American-Jewish Joint Distribution Committee (AJDC), professional courses and all the preparations should be done in Ethiopia, where the Falasha ought to undergo the verification process. Such arrangement would enable them much easier adaptation in Israel. Unfortunately, the government refused to allocate funds for this kind of projects, even though detailed plans were already accepted by different bodies, including governmental institutions. In the 2006 budget the Israeli Ministry of Finance set aside an additional 45 million USD to accelerate the immigration process from Ethiopia. However, no concrete steps were undertaken.

---

[9] This operation was organised in co-operation with the Israeli Ministry of Absorption and the Jewish Agency. One of the requirements of this operation was the need to sponsor the bringing to Israel of a few small groups of the Falasha.

[10] *Haaretz*, 29-05-2006.

When we discuss the financial matters, then some problems always arise: how many Falasha still remain in Ethiopia, how many are willing to come, and how many of them can legitimately apply for the entrance to Israel. According to the representatives of the Ministry of Interior currently working in Ethiopia, it is impossible to state, even approximately, how many people are waiting for the departure to Israel. In the case of the Falasha, it is very difficult to prove their Jewish origins, and in most cases it even is not possible. For this reason, recently the Law of Return was only sporadically used as the basis for the immigration. In case of the Falash Murah immigration it is more feasible to use the Law of Entry which regulates the arrival to Israel of the family members of the Israeli citizens (family unification regulations). It is estimated that among the immigrants from Ethiopia some 30% are Christians. They travel to Israel to join members of their families who became already the Israeli citizens.

It was no coincidence that the criticism of the indolence of the Israeli government became intensified in the period just before the parliamentary elections of 27 March 2006. The newspapers were reflecting the concerns of their readers who questioned the essence of the Zionist idea and of the Jewish State. They could not tolerate the situation when more than 20,000 Jews were waiting in very poor conditions for coming to the homeland: the homeland which could not decide whether to accept its children and to allocate sufficient means for their settlement. The problem of insufficient funds evoked the greatest controversy.[11] To put this problem in a proper perspective, the examples of the previous large immigration waves were brought: the emigration wave of 1950s, the Yom-Kipur War wave, and the most recent wave from the former Soviet Union. The readers used to ask why a different standard was applied to the Ethiopian immigrants in the situation when Israel over the latest 10 years welcomed more than 250,000 Russian non-Jews, claiming that the descendants of those immigrants would one day become the true Israeli citizens.

---

[11] *The Jerusalem Post*, 15-03- 2006.

Once the excitement connected with the election process had died down, and the new government undertook its duties, it turned out that these pre-election promises were not taken seriously. In the opinion of the Interior Minister, R. Bar-On, bringing the rest of the Falash Murah from Ehthiopia to Israel is not the government's priority, and the delay in the immigration process is by no means dependent only on the lack of funds.[12] Minister Bar-On stated that the implementation of the previous plans concerning the Ethiopian Jews would cost the State budget some 4 billion shekels, and at the time being the State could not afford it. The same Minister reduced the number of the Falasha qualified in the verification and preparation processes from 17,000 to 10,000 souls. Contrary to its earlier declared obligations, the government rejected the demand to increase the pace of the Ethiopian immigration. The Minister of Finance, A. Hirchson, expressed concern about the costs of the future increased immigration from Ethiopia. He also asked for a postponement of all decisions in this matter until the debate over the budget for the following year was completed. He reasoned that the main problem was not the costs of bringing the Falasha to Israel but the long term fixed costs once they arrived. Minister Bar-On added that even though the budget could cover the costs of bringing them to Israel, it would not solve the problem of the Ethiopians. They remain too long in the absorption centres which not only increases the costs of their *aliyah* but also slows down, and in some cases makes impossible the assimilation of them into the Israeli society. Therefore, according to the Ministers the debate should not concentrate over the absorption but rather on money having been squandered.

Minister Bar-On referred also to one of the most serious problems, which is being caused by schools attended by the Ethiopian immigrants.[13] In many cases, especially in the suburbs of the large cities, these schools become "Ethiopian schools". One has to refer to the increasingly common phenomenon: schools admitting a large number of the Ethiopian students are being abandoned by their "white colleagues". This situation leads to the creation of the real black ghettos whose members are more and more unable to escape

---

[12] *The Jerusalem Post*, 21-06-2006.

[13] Interview with Bar-On, *The Jerusalem* Post, 27-06-2006.

and join the mainstream of the Israeli society. Such a situation also increases the absorption costs of the immigrants.

Bar-On referred also to his meeting with the representatives of the Ministry of Absorption and of the Jewish Agency. They were asked whether they could find some additional means in their institutional budgets to cover the costs of bringing all the remaining Falasha to Ethiopia as well as the costs of the absorption process. The immediate response was that it would not be possible. Thus, in the opinion of the Minister of Interior one should use common sense and bring as many immigrants as it is possible for the Jewish society to absorb.

The ghettos' problem does not confine itself to schools as it appears also in synagogues. The new immigrants from Ethiopia are looked at with great suspicion as far as the character of their Judaism is concerned. Very often they are excluded from the religious life since they cannot participate with others in all parts of the service. In the opinion of S. Mula[14] from the Jewish Agency, the problem of ghettos and religious isolation is very common. He believes that the proposed solution of opening separate synagogues with a modified or simplified liturgy does not bring the desired effects. On the contrary, it further separates the Falasha from the rest of the society.

Governmental decisions have usually been met with a severe criticism. For example, Zeev Bielski from the Jewish Agency did not agree to the financial limits and to the arguments justifying them. Critical voices were coming from the American side. Activists from the Jewish organisations in the United States used to emphasise the lack of interest of the State of Israel in bringing the immigrants from Africa. They considered the actions of the government to have a racist colouring and rejected the financial argument since they believed that the volume of the absorption costs was highly overestimated. The activists were also surprised to learn that there was not enough means in the budget, even though the increased rate of the immigration from Ethiopia was planned well in advance and the

---

[14] Shlomo Mula was the first Ethiopian to become a member of the World Zionist Organisation Council and Director of the Anti-Semitism Department of this institution.

preliminary decision was taken in 2005. In such a situation the argument of the unexpected costs should not be raised at all.

Few organisations supporting the Falasha in Israel put forward the question of the discrimination practices, which were directed against the Ethiopian Jews by some official bodies. Such practices are clearly visible when they are looked at from the perspective of the European (particularly French) and North American immigration, which was strongly encouraged. According to a common believe it was the duty of the Israel to take care of all the Jews, irrespective of their origin or their material status. During a meeting with Minister Bar-On, the representatives of the Jewish organisations once more tried to get an answer concerning the possibility of doubling the rate of the immigration from Ethiopia but it was of no avail.[15] However, all agreed that the "Operation Promise" was ineffective[16], and that this opinion ought to be forwarded to the Prime Minister Olmert with the hope for the change of the government's stand. The Minister for Absorption, Z. Boim also did not support Bar-On's policy claiming that even though the Falasha are not Halachic Jews, one should not abandon the decisions and recommendations of the Prime Minister Sharon in 2005.

Rejection of the Government's obligations towards the Ethiopian immigrants was also condemned outside Israel. I. Cotler, former Canadian Minister of Justice and fighter for human rights clearly stated that the Israeli government limits and even violates the basic rights of the Falasha, especially the right to return to Israel. It is also contrary to the earlier decisions, which were approved by the Supreme Court. In Cotler's opinion, this was the only case in the history of Israel when the government impeded the Jewish immigration. It can be treated as a social injustice, inequality in law, and even racial discrimination. Never in the history of Israel bringing the Jews to the homeland, one of the philosophical bases of the existence of the State, was dependent on the allocation of the financial means. Minister Bar-On's decision was also against the previous agreements

---

[15] *The Jerusalem Post*, 28-06-2006.

[16] By July 2005, of a planned $100 million only $60 million had been collected: *The Jerusalem Post* 9-02-2006.

with the Jewish organisations, especially those from the United States, which voluntarily took upon themselves the responsibility of gathering an extra money for the Ethiopian Jews. I. Cotler once again pointed out the stark difference in the position between the very active policy of the government towards the immigrants from other (especially European) countries and the prejudice towards the Jewish immigrants from Africa.

Zofia Podobińska
University of Warsaw

La Tanzanie à la veille du changement (?) de l'hymne national

Abstract

A change of the national anthem is not surprising throughout the course of a country's history. It has taken place three times so far in Afghanistan. In Africa itself Mozambique and Rwanda have recently adopted new anthems. This article discusses Tanzania's need for the introduction of such a change, which results from the fact that Tanzania's anthem has never fully been its own.

The author attempts to show the main arguments of both the opponents and adherents of the hitherto existing anthem. The anthem is presented and compared to other, mostly African, praise songs, leading to an in-depth analysis of the content of the text of the current anthem. It is followed by more general thoughts considering the role of anthems in the social and political life of a country. The decision whether or not to introduce a new anthem in Tanzania has still not been reached.

Lorsqu'au printemps 2007 je présentais à mes étudiants l'hymne de la Tanzanie, on m'a demandé quelle était la date de sa création. Je me suis alors limitée à la supposition qu'elle devrait coïncider avec l'acquisition de l'indépendance par ce pays[1]; j'ai

---

[1] La République Unie de Tanzanie a été créée en 1964 suite à la fusion de la Tanganyika et de l'île de Zanzibar (d'où son nom composé de TAN + ZAN). La Tanganyika est devenue indépendante trois ans auparavant, et le Zanizibar – en 1963. Beaucoup d'hymnes africains ont été composés au début des années 60 du XXe siècle, ce qui était lié à la montée des mouvements independantistes sur ce continent; la plupart des hymnes datent du XXe siècle, tandis que le plus ancien – celui du Liberia – date de 1847 (et sa musique, de 1860).

cependant décidé de m'y intéresser de plus près. Cela en valait largement la peine, c'est ce que j'ai bientôt constaté en surfant sur internet. Les premières informations que j'ai recueillies m'ont déjà révélé des faits totalement surprenants. Quelques mois auparavant, ce pays africain avait vu s'animer une discussion publique au sujet de l'hymne national actuel de Tanzanie qui ne serait pas en fait son propre hymne à elle, mais celui de la République sud-africaine (aussi bien en ce qui concerne la musique que les paroles, qui seraient une traduction de la langue xhosa en swahili du si connu *Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika*). Bref, les Tanzaniens n'auraient pas d'hymne à eux, constatation que l'on retrouve dans le titre de l'article d'A. Ngurumo *Tukubaliane, hatuna wimbo wa taifa* ('Il faut nous rendre à l'évidence – nous n'avons pas d'hymne') (2007a).

1. La Tanzanie face au manque de son propre hymne

Dans l'article sus-mentionné, l'auteur évoque ses propres expériences et décrit ce qui a eu lieu en 2001 à Mbabane, capitale du Swaziland, lorsque les participants à un atelier international ont eu l'idée de chanter tour à tour l'hymne de chacun des pays qu'ils représentaient. Avant que deux Tanzaniens aient terminé la première strophe, quelqu'un s'est déjà mis à protester que c'était l'hymne de la République d'Afrique du Sud, et une autre personne a surenchéri en disant que c'était ... l'hymne de la Zambie.

Eh bien, sans aucun doute personne ne s'attendait à ce que la proposition de se distraire aille déclencher une longue discussion bien animée. La dispute d'alors n'a cependant abouti à aucune conclusion, et les Tanzaniens n'ont pas perdu la face (je le souligne non sans raison), car leurs opposants n'étaient pas bien au courant et ont vite accepté les arguments de leurs interlocuteurs. L'auteur lui-même n'a pas pris non plus l'initiative de continuer la recherche. Peut-être que c'est faute de situations (comme une visite à l'échelle internationale ou des médailles gagnées lors des compétitions sportives dans une même discipline par des représentants des deux pays) qui aient pu mener à une «confrontation» et attirer l'attention du public à la ressemblance étonnante entre ces hymnes, ne serait-ce que quant à leur mélodie.

Le problème, comme je l'ai signalé, ressurgit quelques années plus tard. Il est actuellement discuté à une échelle beaucoup plus grande et personne ne nie le bien-fondé de la constatation selon laquelle la Tanzanie ne possède pas son propre hymne à elle. Il s'agit maintenant de trouver une solution de ce problème.

C'est un fait évident que les Tanzaniens (et non pas eux seuls, car une situation analogue a eu lieu en Zambie et au Zimbabwe, ex-Rhodésie du Sud – mais dans ce dernier cas, entretemps, et plus précisément en 1994, on a composé un hymne en langues locales: le ndébélé et le shona) ont «emprunté» leur hymne en traduisant en swahili le chant du Congrès National Africain (*African National Congress* ou *ANC*).

Quelques mots d'explication s'imposent. Ce chant avait été composé par un certain Enoch Sontonga, professeur dans une école missionnaire méthodiste de Johannesburg. Il a été écrit en 1897 et avait la forme traditionnelle d'un poème. Je ne vais pas m'étendre sur l'histoire de cette oeuvre; il suffit de dire qu'elle jouit d'une grande popularité, au point d'être reconnue en 1925 par le CNA hymne officiel qui clôture dès lors ses débats. Un an après le triomphe qu'a remporté ce parti, en 1994, lors des premières élections démocratiques, elle a été proclamée, à côté de *Die Stem van Suid-Afrika* ('L'Appel de l'Afrique du Sud', en anglais 'The Call of South Africa') en afrikaans, utilisé auparavant par le gouvernement des Boers/Africaners, l'un des deux hymnes nationaux officiels de la République sud-africaine; deux ans plus tard, les paroles de ces deux chants ont servi de point de départ pour une compilation qui est devenue l'hymne actuel, tout en conservant la musique originale d'E. Sontonga. Pour le peuple de la République sud-africaine, aussi bien avant qu'après l'acquisition de l'indépendance, cette oeuvre était une expression de liberté et de combat pour la libération (elle a acquis sa popularité lors des réunions religieuses, des manifestations publiques et meetings politiques)[2]. Actuellement elle se chante en 5 parmi les 11 langues officielles de ce pays.

---

[2] Il a été popularisé à l'étranger entre autres grâce aux enregistrements de *Lady Smith Black Mambazo*, *Boom Shaka* ou *Mahotella Queens* (cf. Ngurumo 2007a).

Revenons cependant à la Tanzanie et à son problème. L'actuel Ministre de l'Information, de la Culture et du Sport (*Waziri wa Habari, Utamaduni na Michezo*), Muhammed Seif Khatib, doit faire face à la question que ses prédécesseurs n'ont pas su résoudre[3]. La question semble d'autant plus importante qu'elle a, d'une certaine manière, divisé le peuple tanzanien. Une partie des Tanzaniens voudraient avoir un hymne original, d'autres préferent garder l'hymne ancien.

2. Les adversaires et les défenseurs de l'ancien hymne

Pourquoi une telle division s'est-elle produite au sein de la société tanzanienne? La question de l'hymne est importante car sa présence dans les écoles – où il est chanté chaque jour – constitue un moyen de socialisation et d'endoctrination des enfants et des jeunes, auxquels on inculque dès leurs plus jeunes années un certain ensemble de valeurs communes. Avant de passer à la présentation des pour et des contre du nouvel hymne, jetons un coup d'oeil sur les paroles de l'hymne actuel. Les voilà :

Mungu ibariki Afrika *Wabariki viongozi wake* *Hekima, umoja na amani* *Hizi ni ngao zetu* *Afrika na watu wake.* *Ibariki Afrika* *Ibariki Afrika* *Tubariki watoto wa Afrika.*	Dieu, bénissez l'Afrique Bénissez ses dirigeants La sagesse, l'unité et la paix Ce sont nos boucliers À l'Afrique et son peuple. Bénissez l'Afrique Bénissez l'Afrique Bénissez-nous, enfants d'Afrique.

---

[3] On a déjà noté auparavant des tentatives visant le changement de l'hymne (surtout à l'initiative des hommes politiques de l'opposition, cf. Ngurumo 2007a), mais, comme nous venons de le voir, elles n'ont jamais abouti.

Mungu ibariki Tanzania	Dieu, bénissez la Tanzanie
Dumisha uhuru na umoja	Perpétuez la liberté et l'unité
Wake kwa waume na watoto	Des femmes[4] et hommes et enfants
Mungu ibariki	Dieu, bénissez
Tanzania na watu wake.	La Tanzanie et son peuple.
Ibariki Tanzania	Bénissez la Tanzanie
Ibariki Tanzania	Bénissez la Tanzanie
Tubariki watoto wa Tanzania.	Bénissez-nous, enfants de Tanzanie.

Quels sont les arguments des deux parties? Je vais commencer par ceux des opposants de l'hymne ancien. Ils se réduisent à quelques questions essentielles. La première reproche consiste à ce que l'hymne actuel avait été «emprunté», tandis que les Tanzaniens sont parfaitement en mesure de composer un hymne original, bien à eux (on pourrait éventuellement choisir une oeuvre existante); c'est donc la voix de la fierté et de l'honneur national. Deuxièmement, l'hymne ancien ne met pas suffisament l'accent sur la notion de *utaifa*, qui pourrait être traduite comme 'appartenance nationale', voire 'patriotisme'. Et enfin, il manque de *mvuto* 'attrait', car il est perçu comme un chant religieux (entre autres, parce qu'il est chanté en choeur).

Qu'en disent-ils les défenseurs de l'hymne ancien? Mis à part la question de l'emprunt (j'y reviendrai ultérieurement), deux questions essentielles sont à examiner. Premièrement, celle de *utaifa* ci-mentionnée. Comme cela se voit bien dans le texte ci-dessus, l'hymne tanzanien actuel met au premier plan le continent africain dans son integralité, et la Tanzanie, seulement en second. Est-ce

---

[4] Il est intéressant de noter que les femmes y sont énumérées à côté des hommes, ce qui apparaît seulement dans 4 autres hymnes africains: ceux du Botswana, du Malawi, du Mali et du Sénégal (Cusack 2005: 243-245). Les hymnes sont le plus souvent écrits par les hommes (en Afrique, la seule exception est São Tomé et Príncipe) et pour les hommes, présentés souvent comme combattants ou soldats.

pourtant réellement un défaut? Bien sûr, on pourrait y voir une contradiction par rapport à la définition de l'hymne national en tant qu'une oeuvre patriotique, louant les origines et l'histoire d'une nation, ravivant les sentiments patriotiques. Mais d'un autre côté, ceci peut être considéré non pas comme un manque ou un défaut, mais comme une preuve de sagesse mûre et perspicace. En évoquant la métaphore d'un homme qui dort dans une chambre d'une maison menacée par l'inondation, P. Karugendo (2007) constate que celui-ci ne priera pas Dieu qu'Il sauve seulement sa propre chambre, mais plutôt la maison toute entière. Le soin porté à la maison toute entière – c'est-à-dire au continent tout entier („Mungu ibariki Afrika" 'Dieu, bénissez l'Afrique')[5] – ne correspond donc pas à un manque de patriotisme mais à une certaine prévoyance[6].

De même, il n'y a rien d'irrationnel dans la prière de bénir tous les dirigeants de l'Afrique („Wabariki viongozi wake" 'Bénissez ses dirigeants'), et non pas seulement ceux de son propre pays, car cela revient à protéger celui-ci contre les conséquences du mauvais voisinage, qui peut menacer même d'un conflit armé (comme par exemple dans le cas de l'attaque de l'Ouganda contre la Tanzanie, en 1978, sous le gouvernement du dictateur sanglant Idi Amin).

D'ailleurs, dans la seconde strophe de l'hymne – considerée, à tort, comme première, car souvent, faute de temps, c'est la seule chantée (par exemple lors de la remise des médailles ou avant un

---

[5] Le même appel à l'Afrique toute entière se retrouve dans les hymnes d'Angola, de Ghana, de Zambie et de Sénégal (dans les deux derniers, on rencontre l'expression «mère Afrique»), ce qui semble être un produit du panafricanisme (Cusack 2005: 242s.).

[6] Le même auteur constate plus loin qu'en dehors du continent africain, ce qui est remarqué avant tout, c'est la couleur de la peau de ses habitants et non pas leur pays d'origine. A son avis, cela semble confirmer l'idée divine: Dieu lui-même aurait créé le continent et son peuple, tandis que toutes les divisions intérieures (les frontières artificielles entre les pays) seraient le résultat d'une intervention extérieure (le résultat, notamment, des résolutions de la conférence de Berlin, en 1884). Par conséquent, le fait de faire passer les intérêts particuliers d'un pays avant l'intérêt commun équivaut, dans un certain sens, à prêter son appui aux anciens colonisateurs, et devrait même être considéré comme un péché (*dhambi*).

match) – il apparaît déjà un patriotisme strictement local. Ses paroles disent „Mungu ibariki Tanzania" 'Dieu, bénissez la Tanzanie'.

A titre de contre-argument, on peut également ajouter que l'hymne actuel de la Tanzanie exprimait, dès son apparition, l'idée d'une opposition contre l'oppression des Africains par les Blancs. En plus, les paroles ont été écrites par un Africain, et elles ne se réfèrent d'aucune manière à des divisions basées sur l'appartenance éthnique ou régionale. L'hymne propage ainsi l'idée de *udugu* 'fraternité'. Les mots clés, liés aux valeurs africaines qui y apparaissent, sont *hekima, umoja na amani* 'sagesse, unité et paix'. Ils constituent le fondement des principes et des normes de comportement ainsi qu'un outil de la création et de l'affermissement de l'ordre social et moral[7].

La deuxième reproche est aussi facile à refuter, car beaucoup d'hymnes comportent un élément religieux[8], car ils constituent une sorte de *sala ya taifa* 'prière du peuple' adressée à Dieu (cf. non seulement les hymnes des pays musulmans d'Afrique, comme la Libye, le Maroc et le Soudan, mais aussi ceux du Zimbabwe, du Kenya et de l'Ouganda) et ont été composés pour être chantés à plusieurs voix[9], *a capella* ou avec accompagnement. L'origine de ce genre de textes se trouve justement dans la religion, c'est pourquoi beaucoup d'oeuvres commencent par la demande de bénédiction divine.

---

[7] Une preuve de la force exercée par la musique sur les esprits des Africains pourrait être le procès intenté à Arusha, en Tanzanie, devant *International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda* 'le Tribunal Pénal International pour le Rwanda' (*ICTR/TPIR*) à un chanteur bien connu, Simon Bikindi, accusé d'inciter dans ses oeuvres à la haine et à l'extermination des membres du groupe ethnique Tutsi. Ses chansons passaient régulièrement à l'antenne de la radio et à la télé à partir de la fin des années 80 du siècle dernier, avant même qu'aient lieu les combats fratricides dans ce pays en 1994 (Hirondelle 2007, cf. aussi Craig, Mkhize 2006).

[8] Certains ont un caractère militaire prononcé, ce qu'on reprochait p.ex. à l'hymne français *la Marseillaise*. Parmi les hymnes africains, on peut y mentionner l'hymne algérien ou celui précédent du Mozambique.

[9] La forme chorale est également une influence étrangère. Les oeuvres chorales sont cependant à tort identifiées avec les oeuvres religieuses.

Les paroles citées, „Mungu ibariki Afrika" 'Dieu, bénissez l'Afrique', qui sont une traduction littérale en swahili des mots *Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika* (en langue xhosa), figurent donc non seulement dans l'hymne tanzanien, mais aussi dans celui zambien. Mais ce n'est pas tout. Car lesdits hymnes n'ont rien de particulier, comparés à d'autres: l'hymne kenyen (1963) commence par le tour „Ee Mungu nguvu yetu" 'Dieu, notre force', et celui ougandien (1962) par „Ewe Uganda, Mungu akulinde" 'Ouganda, que Dieu te protège'. Les appels à Dieu se retrouvent également dans les oeuvres d'autres cultures, p.ex. dans l'hymne de la Grande Bretagne nous avons „God bless the Queen"[10] 'Dieu, bénissez la Reine', et dans celui libyen, à plusieurs reprises revient le tour „Allahu Akbar" 'Dieu/Allah est grand (littéralement 'le plus grand')'[11]. Il n'y a rien d'étonnant dans le fait que les hymnes s'adressent à Dieu en Le priant de bénir et faire prospérer le chef de l'Etat – roi ou sultan – ainsi que la nation toute entière[12].

Les arguments ci-dessus prouvent que l'hymne actuel n'est pas, en principe, si mauvais que ça. On peut donc raisonnablement douter s'il est possible d'en créer ou d'en choisir un autre qui soit fondamentalement différent et en même temps aussi approprié.

---

[10] Ou *King* 'Roi' si le monarque est un homme. Tout au début, c'est-à-dire en 1745, c'était un chant patriotique exprimant les voeux de santé adressés au monarque. Comme le remarque Cusack (2005: 248s.), le nom de Dieu apparaît dans la plupart des hymnes des anciennes colonies britanniques, contrairement à celles françaises. L'absence de la référence à Dieu résulte du caractère séculier de la République Française.

[11] Cependant, les mêmes paroles dans l'hymne de l'Afghanistan (adopté l'année dernière et censé ouvrir une nouvelle époque dans la vie de ce pays, après la chute du régime des talibans) bien qu'elles soient conformes à la constitution de 2004, ont suscité une vive opposition, à cause du caractère sacré attribué à cette expression par l'islam.

[12] La personne du roi apparaît dans les hymnes du Maroc et du Swaziland. Dans l'hymne précédent du Mozambique, il était question du parti *FRELIMO* (*Frente de Libertação de Moçambique* 'Front pour la Libération du Mozambique'), dans ceux de la Namibie et du Zimbabwe – des héros nationaux, et dans ceux du Cameroun et du Bénin – des ancêtres (Cusack 2005: 248).

Il reste d'examiner la reproche – souvent soulignée – de l'appropriation du bien d'autrui, ce qui constitue pour les Tanzaniens une question d'honneur. A. Ngurumo (2007a) constate dans son article qu'il avait pu sauver la face et ne se sentait pas gêné par le fait que la Tanzanie ne possède pas un hymne à elle seule.

Serait-ce effectivement une raison de gêne? En examinant les choses de près on constate qu'en fait les Tanzaniens ont choisi le chant du CNA pour hymne plus de 30 ans avant la République sud-africaine (1961 – 1995). Personne n'aurait pu alors le prévoir[13]. En plus, les paroles de l'hymne actuel de la République d'Afrique du Sud sont en fait une compilation de deux oeuvres, alors il doit être différent de la version tanzanienne (même s'il reste le problème de la ressemblance de la mélodie).

Ce qui plus est, la question de l'appartenance doit-elle effectivement, dans la réalité africaine, être perçue comme une reproche? Il ne faut pas mener de longues recherches pour y répondre, car l'auteur ci-mentionné constate que l'argument qu'il avait utilisé dans la discussion consistait à mettre en valeur l'idée de fraternité, *udugu*, et celle de l'unification, des liens mutuels, *mshikamano*, dont les peuples de l'Afrique ont actuellement besoin. Même si, en partie, ce n'était qu'un prétexte pour garder la face, il a été pris au sérieux par les discutants. Cela veut dire qu'ils en ont été convaincus. L'utilisation commune des biens des prochains faisait partie, dans la civilisation africaine traditionnelle, des pratiques quotidiennes[14]. Ce qui plus est, dans les années 60 et 70 du siècle précédent, la capitale de la Tanzanie, Dar-es-Salaam, était un refuge tranquille non seulement pour les organisations comme *SWAPO* (*South West Africa People's Organization* 'Organisation du Peuple

---

[13] Il n'était pas non plus possible de prévoir, à l'époque, que E. Sontonga serait un jour sacré héros national et décoré à titre posthume par le président Nelson Mandela de la plus haute distinction sud-africaine *Order of Meritorious Service*. Le tombeau du compositeur jouit du status du monument national.

[14] Entre membres de la famille ou entre amis, il était tout à fait normal de se prêter divers objets, y compris les vêtements. Dans les cultures traditionnelles, la musique n'appartenait à personne, on ne pouvait donc se l'approprier.

du Sud-Ouest Africain'), le parti mozambicain *FRELIMO*, mais aussi du CNA dont il était question plus haut, et qui y trouvaient l'aide financière et militaire. C'est justement pour manifester l'unité avec les pays voisins et en signe de solidarité dans la lutte contre l'apartheid, trois pays, à savoir la Tanzanie, la Zambie et le Zimbabwe ont choisi le même hymne. Les partis politiques de différents pays ont aussi pris des noms semblables: *TANU – Tanganyika African National Union*, *KANU – Kenya African National Union*, *ZANU – Zimbabwe African National Union*, en soulignant ainsi la ressemblance de l'histoire de leur lutte contre le colonialisme (Askew 2002: 191). D'où vient donc ce problème de l'hymne «emprunté»?[15]

3. Quelle alternative?

La notion de l'hymne national est apparue en Afrique – de même que la notion de la nation et de l'Etat – comme un des fruits de l'époque coloniale. En Europe, de telles oeuvres surgissent au XVIIIe siècle (l'Espagne, la Grande Bretagne, la France)[16], et se popularisent à l'époque de la création des Etats autonomes lors des deux siècles suivants. Dans d'autres civilisations, en dehors de l'Europe, les hymnes sont également le fruit des influences extérieures. C'est de là que vient leur ressemblance – souvent étonnante – avec la musique de l'Europe occidentale, qui rappelle à beaucoup d'auditeurs un style de musique religieuse. Très peu d'hymnes, paraît-il, sont entièrement basés sur la tradition locale, sans qu'il y ait des influences occidentales (il y a parmi eux, entre autres, ceux de la Chine, du Japon et de l'Iran, et du point de vue strictement musical, celui du

---

[15] Par exemple, l'hymne polonais *Mazurek Dąbrowskiego* a servi de modèle au chant devenu plus tard l'hymne panslave, et ensuite l'hymne officiel de la République de Yougoslavie. Signalons à l'occasion qu'en 2007, on a fêté son 80 anniversaire comme hymne national de la République de Pologne.

[16] Le plus ancien est l'hymne des Pays-Bas *Het Wilhelmus* datant des années 1568-72, c'est-à-dire du temps de la Guerre de Quatre-Vingt-Ans, et les paroles les plus anciennes seraient celles de l'hymne japonais *Kimigayo* 'Le règne de notre Empereur', qui a cependant été officiellement adopté seulement en 1999.

Kenya, qui comporte des éléments de musique tribale traditionnelle, et notamment, la voix des mères berçant leurs enfants[17]).

Et comment les Tanzaniens eux-mêmes conçoivent la notion de l'hymne national? Selon la définition[18] citée par A. Ngurumo (2007b) il s'agit de „nyimbo zinazolenga kuchochea hamasa ya utaifa na uzalendo kwa nchi husika", c'est-à-dire 'chants dont le but est d'éveiller la conscience nationale et les sentiments patriotiques envers son pays'. La Tanzanie possède sa langue nationale (le swahili), son drapeau[19] et son emblème, ses fêtes nationales et ses monuments, ses ensembles de musique et de danse nationaux, ainsi que son art, ce qui – en tant qu'un ensemble d'indices symboliques de l'identité nationale – légitime, d'une certaine façon, l'existence de la nation tanzanienne (Askew 2002: 190, 277). A l'heure actuelle, les ambitions de cette nation se dirigent donc vers le souhait de posséder son propre hymne, qui souligne mieux l'existence de l'Etat.

Le Ministre Khatib aurait proposé six oeuvres satisfaisant à cette exigence, qui devraient être soumises à un référendum. Jusque là, je n'ai pas réussi à trouver les noms de ces oeuvres. Regardons toutefois la proposition avancée par le Parti Révolutionnaire de la

---

[17] Parmi les hymnes africains, celui du Mali est aussi basé sur une ancienne mélodie populaire, venant probablement du XIIIe siècle, du temps du Royaume du Mali; l'hymne du Malawi rappelle le style des chansons sud-africaines, et l'hymne de la Maurétanie, basé sur un poème traditionnel à rythme exotique (appelé *fatchou*), est très difficile à chanter, d'où les fausses rumeurs disant qu'il serait dépourvu de paroles. L'hymne du Sénégal (dont l'auteur est Léopold Sédar Senghor, connu comme écrivain et leader politique) énumère même les noms de quelques instruments de musique régionaux: *kora* (harpe-luth) et *balafon* (xylophone).

[18] Il est facile de remarquer que c'est une définition empruntée à la civilisation occidentale.

[19] Le triangle bleu de la partie inférieure symbolise les lacs et l'océan de ce pays, le triangle vert, supérieur, les champs et les forêts, la bande noire horizontale correspond à la couleur de la peau de ses habitants, et l'ornement jaune/doré qui l'entoure – à ses richesses naturelles. La couleur verte était également celle du parti *TANU*. Une grande partie des hymnes africains comporte des références directes aux drapeaux ou étandards (Cusack 2005: 236 évalue cette partie à un tiers), mais ce n'est pas le cas de la Tanzanie.

Tanzanie (*Chama cha Mapinduzi* ou *CCM*), au moment où celui-ci avait accédé au pouvoir: il s'agissait de prendre pour hymne national le chant *Tanzania nakupenda kwa moyo wote* 'Tanzanie, je t'aime de tout mon coeur'. Voici ses paroles:

Tanzania Tanzania, nakupenda kwa moyo wote,	Tanzanie, Tanzanie, je t'aime de tout mon coeur,
Nchi yangu Tanzania, jina lako ni tamu sana	Tanzanie, ma patrie, ton nom m'est si doux
Nilalapo nakuwaza wewe, niamkapo ni heri mama wee	Je m'endors en songeant à toi, o mère, et je me réveille heureux
Tanzania Tanzania, nakupenda kwa moyo wote.	Tanzanie, Tanzanie, je t'aime de tout mon coeur.
Tanzania Tanzania, ninapokwenda safari,	Tanzanie, Tanzanie, quand je partirai en voyage,
Kutazama maajabu, biashara nayo makazi,	Pour regarder les merveilles de la nature, le commerce et les demeures des hommes
Sitaweza kusahau mimi, mambo mema ya kwetu hakika	Je ne pourrai pas oublier les valeurs de notre culture
Tanzania Tanzania, nakupenda kwa moyo wote.	Tanzanie, Tanzanie, je t'aime de tout mon coeur.
Tanzania Tanzania, watu wengi wanakusifu,	Tanzanie, Tanzanie, tant de gens sont fiers
Siasa yako na desturi, ilituletea uhuru	De ta politique et de ta tradition, ce sont elles qui nous ont apporté la liberté
Hatuwezi kusahau sisi, mambo mema ya kwetu hakika	Nous ne pouvons pas oublier les valeurs de notre culture
Tanzania Tanzania, nakupenda kwa moyo wote.	Tanzanie, Tanzanie, je t'aime de tout mon coeur.

C'est sans aucun doute un chant tanzanien ressenti comme patriotique. Satisfait-il à d'autres critères? Je dois dire qu'à mon avis, cette proposition est loin d'être parfaite, car aussi bien du point de vue de sa composition (trop de longueurs) que de son contenu, elle n'égale pas l'hymne actuel, dont la forme concise réussit à rendre les valeurs traditionnelles essentielles de la civilisation du continent africain (comme *Mungu* 'Dieu', *hekima* 'sagesse', *umoja* 'unité',

uhuru 'liberté', *amani* 'paix' et *udugu* 'fraternité'[20]), tandis que le chant en question ne nous offre rien de plus que des clichés, du sentimentalisme (bien qu'il s'agisse sans aucun doute d'un amour ardent envers la mère-patrie), et une vision superficielle du pays[21] (je suis cependant loin de vouloir nier le besoin d'être fier de la politique, de la tradition et de l'indépendance!). L'auteur veut souligner le caractère exceptionnel de son pays en utilisant une sorte de langue floue et imprécise: à quelles valeurs de la culture pense-t-il? Pour des raisons évidentes, je passe sur la question de la mélodie. Et je n'exprime ici, bien sûr, que mon opinion personnelle. Il se pose cependant toujours la question de savoir, si les autres six oeuvres représentent effectivement un niveau artistique plus élevé.

Conclusion

A la fin de son article, A. Ngurumo (2007a) pose la question: „Sisi tunangoja nini?" 'Qu'attendons-nous?', suggérant qu'il faut abandonner «la propriété d'autrui» et prouver que les Tanzaniens sont en mesure de composer leur propre hymne.

Il est cependant difficile de prévoir à quoi cela aboutira. Quant à moi, j'aime bien l'hymne kenyen, au moins quant à son contenu. Tout comme l'hymne tanzanien actuel, il fait appel à Dieu et Le prie de donner Sa bénédiction (et en plus, vers la fin, exprime la reconnaissance); il met en valeur des valeurs semblables: la justice

---

[20] Il peut être intéressant de considérer la présence de ces mots dans les chants de deuil *nyimbo za mambolezo* consacrés au Père de la Nation tanzanienne Julius Nyerere, décédé en 1999. Leur pourcentage respectif est le suivant : Dieu *Mungu/ Mwenyezi/ Mola...* 70%, paix *amani* 45% (paix mondiale: 9%), unité *umoja* 38%, sagesse *hekima/ busara/ ushauri* 30%, liberté *uhuru* 12% (d'après Askew 2006: 33). Ces statistiques confirment entièrement la présence et l'actualité de ces valeurs dans la vie sociale de la Tanzanie.

[21] Le motif de l'amour de la patrie apparaît dans une partie des hymnes, entre autres dans celui (nouveau) du Mozambique (*Pátria Amada* 'Patrie bien-aimée'). Certains d'entre eux énumèrent les traits caractéristiques du pays, comme sa localisation exceptionnelle, son paysage, p.ex. les îles, les fleuves, les mers, les montagnes, les savanes, ou encore ses richesses naturelles (Cusack 2005: 248s.).

(*haki*), la fraternité (*udugu*), la paix (*amani*) et la liberté (*uhuru*)[22]. L'essentiel, c'est aussi qu'il met l'accent sur l'avenir et le développement (*ustawi*)[23] du pays. L'hymne tanzanien se caractérise, de ce point de vue, par une acceptation totale du destin qui se trouve entre les mains de Dieu, tandis que celui kenyen appelle à l'action („Amkeni ndugu zetu" 'Levez-vous[24], frères'), encourage au sacrifice et à l'effort pour le bien du pays („Tufanye sote bidii, Nasi tujitoe kwa nguvu" 'Nous tous faisons un effort, sacrifions-nous de toutes nos forces'), et il souligne la nécessité d'agir ensemble („Tuungane mikono pamoja kazini" 'Unissons-nous dans le travail'). On y trouve à plusieurs reprises les pronoms de la 1e personne du pluriel: «nous», «notre» etc. (beaucoup plus souvent que dans l'hymne tanzanien[25]), qui sont un indice de l'appartenance au même groupe. Les chanteurs se prononcent en leur propre nom, s'adressant à leurs compatriotes, et les appelant à défendre ensemble leur pays, à construire la nation, à aimer et à respecter la patrie.

Quelle que soit la décision définitive concernant l'hymne de la Tanzanie, il faut espérer que les Tanzaniens sortiront vainqueurs du défi auquel ils doivent faire face et, si vraiment ils ne veulent pas garder l'hymne actuel[26], qu'ils choisiront ou créeront quelque chose

---

[22] La question des valeurs communes, de la religion et des coutumes (*ethos*), énumérées à côté des 8 autres valeurs, se retrouve chez Brann (1999: 70).

[23] Les paroles des hymnes du Mali et de l'Angola mettent également l'accent sur l'action et le sacrifice («comme les soldats»).

[24] Le même appel se retrouve dans l'hymne de la Nigérie, du Nigre, de la République Démocratique du Congo, de la Zambie, du Tchad et du Botswana.

[25] Dans la proposition alternative (*Tanzania nakupenda kwa moyo wote*) c'est le pronom de la 1e personne du singulier («moi», «mon») qui domine, ce qui implique nettement l'orientation vers l'individualisme, à l'opposé du collectivisme caractéristique des cultures traditionnelles de l'Afrique.

[26] La question du changement de l'hymne ne serait rien d'exceptionnel. En Afrique, c'est le cas du Mozambique après les élections de 2002. Plus tôt, en 1996, les Iles du Cap Vert ont abandonné l'hymne qu'elles partageaient avec la Guinée Bissau depuis 1975. Le Togo et la République Démocratique du Congo (le Zaïre entre 1972 et 1997) sont revenus à leurs hymnes anciens. Un motif particulièrement pertinent de ces changements étaient les

d'original, de pas banal, qui permette de mettre en valeur leur identité nationale tout en étant une oeuvre de qualité aussi bien sur le plan du contenu que sur celui artistique. Le mot d'ordre est donné.

<div align="right">Automne 2007</div>

P.S.

Un an est passé. Rien n'a, paraît-il, changé. Les leaders tanzaniens font toujours référence, dans leurs discours, à l'hymne ancien. J. F. Mbatia (du parti *National Convention for Construction and Reform NCCR – Mageuzi*), alarmé par l'actualité du pays (les clivages au sein de la société, résultant de diverses formes de la criminalité, et plus particulièrement des progrès de la magie, aussi chez les membres du parlement, qui aboutissent entre autres à des assassinats des albinos ou des vieilles femmes accusées de sorcellerie), dans un appel adressé aux dirigeants politiques et à la nation toute entière, le 8 juin, cite d'importants fragments de l'hymne, affirmant entre autres qu'il constitue une sorte de contrat entre Dieu et le peuple (Nccrmageuzi 2008). Il dit: „Tunapoimba wimbo wetu wa taifa tunamwomba Mungu atupe viongozi wenye hekima na busara ya kujenga taifa lenye umoja na amani" 'En chantant notre hymne nous prions Dieu de nous donner des dirigeants sages et raisonnables pour qu'ils construisent une nation qui vive en unité et en paix'. Et il continue: „[...] taifa letu limepoteza Hekima, Umoja na Amani" '[...] notre peuple a perdu la Sagesse, l'Unité et la Paix'. Ses paroles confirment incontestablement la valeur du message de l'ancien hymne.

événements de Rwanda, qui, en 2001, a décidé de se couper – aussi au niveau symbolique – de son passé violent et sanglant.

Bibliographie:

Adriko Mundua J., op, 2006, „Clé pour une exécution consciente de l'hymne national", *Congo Afrique* XLVI, 409, 408-418.

Askew K.M., 2002, *Performing the nation. Swahili music and cultural politics in Tanzania*, Chicago & London: The University of Chicago Press.

Id., 2006, „Sung and unsung: musical reflections on Tanzanian post-socialisms", *Africa* 76, 1, 15-43.

Brann C.M.B., 1999, „Notes on factorial analysis of 'nation'", *MAJOLLS* 1, 70-82.

Craig D., Nomalanga Mkhize, 2006, „Vocal killers, silent killers: popular media, genocide, and the call for benevolent censorship in Rwanda", en: Drewett M., Cloonan M. (éds), *Popular music censorship in Africa*, Burlington: Ashgate Publishing, 39-52.

Cusack I., 2005, „African national anthems: 'Beat the drums, the red Lion has roared'", *Journal of African Cultural Studies* 17, 2, 235-251.

Ficek R., 2007, *Tanzania, narodziny i funkcjonowanie państwa* [Tanzanie, la naissance et le fonctionnement de l'Etat], Toruń: Adam Marszałek.

Hirondelle, 2007, „ICTR/BIKINDI – inside the music of an artist charged with genocide", en: www.hirondellenews.com/en/ february, 14.02.07.

Karugendo P., 2007, „Mjadala wa wimbo wa taifa (Rai)" [Discussion concernant l'hymne national (Rai)], en: maggidmjengwa.blogspot.com /2007/01/p-karugendo-mjadala-wa-wimbo-wa.html.

Ngurumo A., 2007a, „Tukubaliane, hatuna wimbo wa taifa" [Il faut nous rendre à l'évidence – nous n'avons pas d'hymne], en: www.freemedia.co.tz/daima /2007/3/4/makala1.php.

Id., 2007b, „Wimbo wa Afrika Mashariki: tusimwonee Waziri Khatib" [L'hymne de l'Afrique de l'Est: ne tyrannisons pas le Ministre Khatib], en: www.freemedia.co.tz/daima/2007/3/11/ makala4.php.

Nccrmageuzi, 2008, „Tamko la chama kuhusu hali ya kisiasa na hatma ya Tanzania" [Opinion du parti sur la situation politique et la chute de la Tanzanie], 10.07.2008, en: www.nccrmageuzi.or.tz/ content/view/396/39/.

Autres sources d'internet:
david.national-anthems.net/index.html, 2007/11/07.
en.wikipedia.org/wiki/National_anthem, 2007/04/07.
national-anthems.org/history.htm, 2007/11/07.
nationalanthems.info/gb.htm, 2007/04/07.
pl.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hymn_Polski, 2007/04/07.
tanzania.go.tz/tanzaniakwakifupiF.html, 2007.11.07.

Reviews

Fr. Andrzej Halemba, *Mambwe Folk-Tales* **(***Mambwe Version***),
Warszawa, Oficyna Wydawniczo-Poligraficzna „Adam", 2005,
303 pp;** *Mambwe Folk-Tales* **(English Version), Warsaw, Oficyna
Wydawniczo-Poligraficzna „Adam", 2005, 351 pp.**

This review is based exclusively on the English version, as be-
sides Swahili the reviewer is not familiar with any other Bantu lan-
guage. It is Fr. A. Halemba who became an unquestioned expert in
the field of the Mambwe language, literature and culture. He first
travelled to Zambia (where the Mambwe live) in 1983 and during ten
years of the missionary work translated the New Testament into
Mambwe. In 1994 he published a Mambwe-English dictionary,
which comprises 17.500 entries and so far is the largest Bantu lan-
guage dictionary in Zambia.

When the dictionary appeared in print the author went to Lu-
saka with his newly-published book to meet Minister Mpande who
came from the Mambwe ethnic group. It was Mr. Mpande who en-
couraged him to collect and edit the unwritten Mambwe folk-tales.
This was a decisive moment, because earlier A. Halemba was hesi-
tating, as he believed that by writing the stories down one deprives
them of the vitality of the original versions, „[...] and the emotions
and sense of humour are lost" (p. 9). Now he decided to revitalise
proverbs, puzzles and folk-tales, which he used to include in his ser-
mons to make them more lively and entrancing.

The book is composed of an introduction, a selection of the
Mambwe folk-tales and a number of appendixes. On the editorial
page one can read: „Translation: Fr. Andrzej Halemba, Introduction:
Maria Środoń". It is rather misleading information because the intro-
duction was obviously written by A. Halemba and probably its Polish
version was translated into English by Maria Środoń.

The introduction (not indicated as such, pp. 7-32), besides acknowledgements, contains the history of interest in the Mambwe folk-tales (emphasising the role of Daniel Simungula, a local informer), a presentation of few theories on African tales and folklore, some valuable remarks on the Mambwe stories, and the history of the Mambwe people in outline. Like in other African societies, the Mambwe stories are provided with opening and closing formulas. A story-teller behaves like an actor during his performance and illustrates the narrative with gestures, facial expression and mimicking heroes' movements. When enumerating the recurring themes and motifs of the Mambwe stories, the author put the stress on those referring to an animal delivered from peril of death that tries to kill its rescuer. The plot of this kind appears often in the folk-tales of other African peoples, the case of Hausa being an example.

A. Halemba rejects some evolutionary claims that stories, and likewise all oral literature, have no individual authors. He reminds us that the Mambwe oral literature, „[...] though based on age-old themes, is a living art and has its specific authors, who continuously adapt both contents, form and meaning to the current situation" (p.19). Authors or adapters? This question is thoroughly dealt with by Said Babura Ahmad in *Narrator as an Interpreter. Stability and Variation in Hausa Tales* (Köln 1997).

In the outline on the Mambwe people one can find a history of this ethnic group (based mainly on the oral tradition) and useful information on the social structure and certain beliefs of the „tribe". It is only a pity that one is neither able to find any data on the number of the people nor he is given bibliographical notes on Greenberg's and Guthrie's works mentioned on p. 27.

The main corpus of the book comprises 118 folk-tales and 19 second versions of some of the stories. They have been divided into six groups: the hare and its friends (1-23), different animals (24-36), the people and their problems (37-73), spirits and monsters (74-87), magic tales (88-109) and aetiological tales (110-118). Each folk-tale is provided with the moral(s), the Mambwe (sometimes with English equivalents) proverbs referring to the story and an enumeration of its subjects. All of them are illustrated with excellent drawings by Krystian Myszor: the concept of some of them has been delineated by Maiko Sailas.

The edition of the Mambwe folk-tales was thought not only as a transcription and preservation of one of the literary genres but also as a guide in the missionary work. This is clearly visible in statements like: „[...] we must seek the advice of Jesus Christ. The Hare represents Jesus Christ who saves us from Satan to this day" (p. 65); „[...] in the Christian marriage the husband and wife should have the same rights" (p. 101); „[...] this story talks of the Catholic Church in that we all wear the same fabric - the fabric being baptism" (p. 152), „[...] the story holds true to the words of Jesus Christ" (p. 292), etc.

The division or the folk-tales into groups has a tentative character and sometimes one is not sure whether a story belongs, let us say, to the magic tales or to those dealing with spirits and monsters. From time to time one has to decide whether a given folk-tale should be placed among tales about different animals or among those referring to the people and their problems. Only one group of the folk-tales seems to be homogeneous: the hare and its friends.

The hare is a trickster who appears in stories among many peoples belonging to the Bantu family: Ila, Bemba, Shona and others. This character is depicted as „[...] comical, unusually cunning, crafty and shrewd animal capable of any malice" (p. 12). All those features are also typical of a Hausa trickster who is known as Spider Gizo. With a unique different trait: the hare is always winner whereas Gizo happens to be embittered or even beaten.

The book is supplemented by many annexes. 1. Some information about Mambwe folk-tales' authors; 2. Authors of the folk-tales 1-118; 3. Authors of the folk-tales - second version 1-19; 4. Index of characters, and 5. Index of subjects. I am not sure whether the informers should be called „authors", as in the foot-notes one finds statements like: „written down by..., recorded". Their names make us believe that the majority of them are Christians which to some extent makes it difficult to analyse ancient customs, beliefs and the Mambwe culture as a whole.

The book has been edited very carefully and scrupulously. It is almost completely devoid of any misprints. Only few of them have been noticed by the reviewer: *proverbs says* instead of *proverbs say* (p. 35); *then* instead of *than* (p. 38); *consider* instead of *considered*, and *a far as* instead of *as far as* (p. 212). The phrase *Ndiyo shamba lya sungula* (p. 58) is rather in a broken Swahili. In Standard Swahili its sounds: *Ndiyo shamba la sungura*.

Summing up: the book by A. Halemba belongs to the most valuable anthologies of the African literature in the native languages. It will serve for generations of those not only interested in the missionary work in Africa, but also those who study various aspects of the African culture.

Stanisław Piłaszewicz

Fr. Andrzej Halemba, *Religious and Ethical Values in the Proverbs of the Mambwe People (Zambia)*, Part I, Warszawa, Oficyna Wydawniczo-Poligraficzna „Adam", 2005, 346 pp.; *Religious and Ethical Values in the Proverbs of the Mambwe People* (Zambia), Part II - *Proverbs*, Warszawa, Oficyna Wydawniczo-Poligraficzna „Adam", 2005, 658 pp.

This monumental and epoch-making paroemiological study is based on a Ph.D, thesis, which in 2004 was presented to the Faculty of Theology, Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński's University in Warsaw. As it is stated on p. 13, the research on the Mambwe proverbs had been never carried out before the author took a serious interest in them. The first largest collection of proverbs compiled by A. Halemba was published in the *Mambwe-English Dictionary* (1994).

It is pertinent to remind the reader that the proverbs were often cited in the homily guidelines for the Sunday liturgy by the missionaries working among the Mambwe people. One of them was Fr. Felix Hoffman: he asked one of his catechists, Daniel Simungala, to compile a list of the most common Mambwe proverbs. The Simungala collection comprising 131 items was in 1984 typed out and put in some order by A. Halemba, who began his own field work and synthetic analysis of the proverbs which were amassed by himself and by a team of four wise Mambwe men. He joined together two basic collections, that of Simungula and his own, and put them in alpha-

betical order. 1020 proverbs and over 100 alternative forms were collected in this way.

The first part of the study is composed of four chapters. Chapter one is titled „Natural and historical conditions of the Mambwe people" (pp. 19-33) and sets this ethnic group in their geographical and historical context, as it is indispensable for the analysis of the proverbs. Besides the information on the natural environment (typographical characteristics of the region, climate and soil, vegetation and wildlife) one can find in it some stories referring to the migration of the Bantu groups and a history of the Mambwe people based on oral tradition.

The second chapter of the thesis, „Selected theoretical issues and questions concerning research into the Mambwe proverbs" (pp. 35-76), is conceived as an introduction to the comparative and conceptual ideas, which absorb attention of the paroemiologists: definitions and concepts of proverbs, their classification and thoughts on the origin of them. Special attention has been given to the paroemiological research carried out in Subsaharan Africa. All that has been discussed in this chapter testifies to a deep knowledge of the theoretical basis of the paroemiological research. Having critically reviewed the most important studies concerning the proverbial lore, the author decided to adhere to the thematical-alphabetical classification of it.

The third and the fourth chapters contain the essential findings of the study. Chapter three, "Religious values in the proverbs of the Mambwe people" (pp. 77-118), presents the traditional religious world of the Mambwe, which more and more becomes shaded and obscured in the modern times. So one can find in it the ideas concerning the Highest Being and His attributes (the Creator, the Eternal and Never-Ending, the Lord of Life and Death, the Father, the Guardian and Healer), his relation to mankind and some forms of his worship. Through the proverbs the reader becomes acquainted with the world of spirits, both those created by God and the spirits of ancestors, as well as evil spirits. Some proverbs make reference to magic practices, spells and healing techniques. The Mambwe proverbs uncover also the eschatological ideas of the people: they emphasise the value of life, point to the quest for immortality and elucidate the concept of death. The graphic presentation of the Mambwe prov-

erbs in this chapter differs radically from that in chapter four and makes the reading somewhat difficult.

The most expanded is the fourth chapter: „Ethical values in the proverbs" (pp. 119-311). These values are dealt with by the majority of the Mambwe proverbs, 749 altogether. The author has divided the proverbial lore into two groups, which refer to the positive (484 in number) and negative values (265) respectively. In each group he placed the proverbs, which describe in succession individual, family and community values. Among the positive individual values he has distinguished such like prudence, kindness, humility, truthfulness, respect, friendship, perseverance and the highly valued serious attitude to work. The family values encompass those referring to the preparation for marriage, to the organisation of the family life and those connected with the upbringing and education of children. As far as the community values are concerned, the proverbs emphasise the importance of the king and his courtiers, the role of the elders and that of the council of elders in the social and political life.

The subdivision of the proverbs discussing the negative behaviours seems to be somehow incoherent. Among the negative individual attitudes pride, greed, egoism, laziness and addictions are exposed. In the family and community life the proverbs disapprove of hatred, jealousy, adultery, use of force, theft, false speech and meddling in other people's affairs.

Each ethical value is exemplified and elucidated by the proper proverb in the Mambwe language and its literal and metaphorical meaning in English. Additional proverbial source material is given in the footnotes and in many cases it is provided with the equivalent English proverbs, which have been very well chosen and testify to the author's high competence in the English language.

The study ends with a „Conclusion" (pp. 311-319), which comprises an attempt to give a synthetic image of the religious and ethical values of the Mambwe people, and an impressive bibliographical list (pp. 320-346).

The second part of the study is an appendix encompassing a comprehensive documentation of the values in the Mambwe proverbs, which have been analysed in part I. It is composed of a dictionary of proverbs, an index of terms which appear in the proverbs, and a thematical index.

The dictionary is composed of 1020 proverbs in an alphabetical order. Besides the data given in part I of the study, each entry is additionally provided with the variants of the Mambwe proverbs, the meaning of the individual lexemes which appear in the proverb, connotational lexemes pointing to the semantic fields of the proverb (put in pairs of opposites) and *muno cizole* - an explanation in the Mambwe language, which has not been mentioned in the „Introduction" (p. 5).

English translation of the thesis by Maria Środoń and A. Halemba deserves a special praise. The publication is almost devoid of misprints and mistakes. In Part I only on p. 18 the phrase *proof reading* is written twice in succession. Other cases are as follows: *subject* instead of *subjected* (p. 16); *square* instead of *squared* (p. 19); *Ankole* instead of *Ankola* (p. 38); *be identical* instead of *beidentical* (p.44); *repeated* instead of *repeat* (p.94); *appeased* instead of *appeases* (p. 96); *and* instead of *an* (p. 106); *risks* instead of *risk* (p. 108); *ought not to worry* instead of *ought not worry* (pp. 129, 181 and 267); *witch-doctor* instead of *witchdoctor* (p.152); *naïveté* instead of *nad'veté* (p.174), *outdo* instead of *out-do* (p.210), *if you want to be received* instead of *if you want to receive* (p. 217), *accept* instead of *accepts* (p. 254), *awareness of* instead of *awarenessof* (p. 287), *is not drunk* instead of *is not drink* (p. 287), *possible* instead of *possibly* (p. 288), *people only would* instead of *people will only would* (p. 300), *instead of* instead of *instead if* (p. 302), and some others. The majority of the misprints are due to the use of the computer as a typewriter! We point to them in order to avoid those shortcomings in case when a second edition of the thesis is planned. If so, in the proof-reading the abundance of *mwene* (*chieftain - king*) should be eliminated, which has been repeated eight times (pp. 247-249).

The study by A. Halemba testifies to the enormous achievements of the Polish missionaries not only in the evangelization, but also in the research in African linguistics and literature, which is mainly conducted from the ethnological point of view.

Stanisław Piłaszewicz

Henry Tourneux (ed.), *Topics in Chadic Linguistics III: Historical Studies; Topics in Chadic Linguistics IV: Comparative and Descriptive Studies. Papers from the 3rd Biennial International Colloquium on the Chadic Languages. Villejuif, November 24-25, 2005*, "Chadic Languages" 4, 5, Köln: Rüdiger Köppe Verlag, 2007, vol. 4: 131 pp.; vol. 5: 155 pp.

The books are a collection of papers from the 3rd Biennial International Colloquium on the Chadic languages that took place in Villejuif on November 24-25, 2005. The two volumes seem to reflect the split in contemporary research concerning Chadic languages: historical lingusitics on the one hand, and description of various morphological, phonologicical and syntactic aspects of particular languages, on the other. *Topics in Chadic Linguistics III* have the following contributions: Sean Allison, "Lingusitic evidence for the islamization of the Makary Kotoko by the Kanuri"; Sergio Baldi, "Les emprunts arabes en dangaleat"; Richard Gravina, "Classification and reconstruction in Chadic Biu-Mandara A"; Olga Stolbova, "Secondary laterals in Chadic"; Gábor Takács, "The Afro-Asiatic background of the North Bauchi consonant system II". All papers concern lexical studies shown from the historical perspective. The first two by Allison and Baldi focus on loanwords, and the rest contain historical reconstructions. By providing a linguistic evidence Allison tries to prove that Kanuri people played an important role in the introduction of Islam to the Makary Kotoko. Looking at the data one has to agree that Kanuri had important cultural influence on Makary Kotoko, but as far as the religious inluence is concerned the data are rather marginal; there are 65 examples of words from various semantic domains: kinship terms, body parts, household terms, marker terms among others, and only 20 religious terms. Baldi presents an extensive list of arabic loanwords in Dangaleat, East Chadic B. The study is based on Western dialect. Baldi's observations concerning loanwords may be summed up in the following statements: most of Arabic loanwords in Dangaleat come form spoken Arabic and most of them are nouns. In contrast to what is found in other languages like Hausa there are not too many terms concerning religion and Muslim civilization. Gravina proposes a new classification of the Biu-Mandara A. The main difference between this classification and the previous one (Newman 1977) is the division of Biu-

Mandara A into three major subgroups: Centre, East and West. The first part of the article contains a detailed discussion of sound laws, such as *r > l, *n > r, *ł > ɮ, *t > ts. The last part comprises the list of 219 roots reconstructed for Biu-Mandara. O. Stolbova investigates words with Proto-Chadic *ṣ (sh-like sibillant) and tries to explain the innovation in Biu-Mandara where *ṣ changed into hl (ł). The data shown in her paper gives an evidence to support Newman's (1977b) hypothesis that a sh-type sibilant existed in Proto-Chadic. Takács looks for the correspondences between Afro-Asiatic (AA) and North Bauchi (NB) consonant systems. According to the author, from the point of view of historical consonantism, NB is the most conservative group in Chadic and in this group traces of AA *ɣ, *ḥ, *ˤ, *h are preserved intact (p. 103). What is perhaps problematic in the analysis is the fact that it is based only on one source - an article written by Skinner (1977) containing many "ambiguities and inconsistencies (p. 104)". The author claims that lack of alternative for North Bauchi lexicon makes „the lexical stock published by Skinner (..) of such an extraordinary importance for Afro-Asiatic historical phonology that even in the present shape it can and should be exploited. Despite all difficulties and controversies, Skinner's precious material is highly informative and has to be used (p. 104f.)". Since the classification and the reconstruction is based on data which have not been checked one may question the accuracy of the output. The author seems to neglect other other sources available for North Bauchi languages, such as an excellent grammar of Miya (Schuh 1998) and a Ph.D. thesis about Pa'a (Skinner 1979). As the historical linguistics does not constitute a part of my research I cannot judge the accuracy of the statements made in this volume. However, I would like to make a general remark concerning editorial issue. Each contributor seems to adapt his own method of transcription which makes comprarison and cross-checking quite difficult, eg. the word for 'egg' in Lamang is written either as *slislín* (p. 61) or as *łiłi* (p. 96); the word for 'name' in Tera is *zlem* (p.67) and *ƛəm* (p. 95).

Topics in Chadic Lingusitics IV has the following contributors: Roberto Ajello, "The linguistic expression of spatial realtion in the Gizey language"; Ari Awagna, "L'extension verbale en buduma"; Roger Blench, "The Dyarim language of Central Nigeria and its affinities"; Raymond Boyd, "Les emplois de certains morphèmes déictiques en bata (tchadique central)"; Doris Löhr, "Predication focus in Malgwa"; Joy Naomi Ruff, "Nasal+obsrtuent sequences in Lagwan"; Henry Tourneux, "L'inversion tonale en Kotoko"; H. Ekkehard Wolff, "Reduplication, aspect, and predication focus in Central Chadic: What Lamang and Hdi tell about Malgwa verb morphology". Ajello focuses on the cognitive analysis of spatial relation between Figure and Ground showing the „semantic transfer of body-part terms to parts of the Ground (p. 12)", eg. *lèyn* (bird) *mùsìy* (seated) *hày* (belly of) *ɓù* (arm) *gùn* (tree) *jè* (there) „the bird is sitting on a branch of the tree". The article differs from the remaining papers in the volume in that it does not make any comparison with other Chadic languages, it is rather limited to the analysis of lexicalization patterns in Gizey. As was noted by Awagna, the autor of the next article, the system of verbal extensions in Buduma, Biu-Mandara B is relatively complex with comparison to the languages belonging to the same branch. Verbal extensions have (a) grammatical functions encoding relations like agent-patient and reflexive (eg. *ná-bènú-hì* 3M.PRF-wash-REFL 'he washed himself'), (b) semantic functions, such as locative or directional marker or (c) aspectual functions expressing the durative or completive action. Blench makes a morpho-phonological sketch of a previously unknown language Dyarim aka Kaiwari. The paper presents some initial data of the language that were colleced in December 2003. The language is spoken on the western edge of Bauchi State, Nigeria, and has been preliminary classified as a part of Zakse/Saya cluster of the South Bauchi languages. Boyd shows various functions of deictic morphems in Bata, Central Chadic. The morphemes may function as locative markers, relative markers, focus markers and predicators in nominal sentences. The paprer written by Ruff describes the nasal+obstruent sequences (e.g. *m̀pálá* 'arm') occuring at the beginning of the word in Lagwan, Central Chadic B. As the data shows, on the one hand, initial nasal is a tone-bearing unit and it can function as a

syllabic phoneme, on the other hand, there is an evidence for tauto-syllabicity. Ruff opts for the explanation that the nasal is an extrasyllabic floting consonant. In his article Tourneux gives many examples of tonal inversion in two languages belonging to the Kotoko group: Maltam and Afadé, e.g. *gò* (Maltam) *gó* (Afadé) 'head' (p. 122). The unconventional explanation of this hypothesis is based on Fédry (1974) who noticed a similar phenomenon in two dialects of Dangaleat and claims that the tone contrast emerged due to some socio-political tensions between two groups of people speaking the two dialects. Two articles written by Löhr and Wolff concern Malgwa, Central Chadic, and are closely interrelated. Löhr presents a complicated TAM (tense-aspect-mood) system that reflects diachronic changes in the language. Reduplication that was once used to to mark perfectivity, synchronically marks predication focus. Wolff explains the changes in Malgwa verb morphology by comparing it to Hdi and Lamang, two languages of the same group within Central Chadic. He also makes a claim that in the prototypical structure of a Chadic verb inflexional system there exists a primary dichtomy of mood: an unmarked indicative mood is opposed to a marked subjunctive mood. The aspect distinction is secondary and allows for a maximally tripartite system: aspect-less, perfective and imperfective (p. 130).

The volumes may be recommended to all Chadicists, and to scholars making research in Afro-Asiatic languages, but also to general linguists interested in topics such as predication focus, verbal extensions, spatial relations and TAM system. Both volumes contain a valuable collection of language data which is accesible to non-Chadicists becuase most papers provide morphological glosses and use IPA symbols.

References:

Fédry, J., 1974, "Pátó à l'Est, pàtò à l'Ouest, ou l'énigme tonale des parlers dangaléat (Tchad) ", in: *Communication au XIème Congrès de la Société linguistique de l'Afrique occidentale, 1-5 avril 1974*, Yaoundé, 25.

Newman, P., 1977, "Chadic classification and reconstructions", *Afroasiatic Linguistics* 5, 1, 1-42.

Id., 1977b, "Lateral fricatives ('H-laterals') in Chadic", in: Newman, P. and R. Ma Newman (eds), *Papers in Chadic Linguistics*, Leiden: Afika-Studiecentrum, 107-119.

Schuh, R.G., 1979, *A Grammar of Miya*, Berkeley: University of California Press, "University of California Publications in Linguistics" 130.

Skinner, M.G., 1998, *Aspects of Pa'anci Grammar*, Ph.D. dissertation, University of Wisconsin.

Skinner, N., 1977, "North Bauchi Chadic languages: common roots", *Afroasiatic Linguistics*, 4, 1, 1-49.

Izabela Will

Georg Ziegelmeyer, *Aspekt adverbialer Subordination im Hausa, Fulfulde und Kanuri*, Westafrikanische Studien 33, Köln, Rüdiger Köppe Verlag, 2008, 240 pp.

The aim of this study is to gain insight into the adverbial subordination in three west African languages, which are classified in different language families: Hausa, Fulfulde and Kanuri. The choice of these languages is conditioned by the fact that all of them are neighbours and to some extent overlap each other. Besides, the author for many years was engaged in learning them and looking into their structure. He tries to uncover the markers and constructions being used in those languages in order to show how the adverbial clause modifies the semantics of the matrix sentence.

The book consists of an introduction, six chapters and a conclusion. The introduction (pp. 1f.) provides some useful information concerning the contents, scope and objectives of this scientific piece of work. The interclausal relations are planned to be researched on the basis of an inventory of the adverbial sentences that used to be described in the traditional grammars and typological studies. The author declares that he is interested in looking at both the formal proprieties of the adverbial subordinators and at their aerial features. All the remarks referring to the form, function and semantic field of those subordinators should serve a better understanding of the language contact phenomena, which can be observed in northern Nigeria. The languages being researched are not genetically related so they are especially suitable for an aerial study.

The first chapter, „Theoretische Grundlagen" (pp. 3-9), in a concise manner presents the theoretical foundations, which have inspired the author and marked off the frames of his research. Since the study has an empirical character none of the theories has been chosen as a leading one. But theories of the functional typology and iconicity in language proved to be of great usefulness in it.

In the second chapter titled „Die weitere Tschadseeregion" (pp. 10-23) G. Ziegelmeyer once more justifies his focus on Hausa, Kanuri and Fulfulde and provides short information on each of them: aerial spread, genetic classification and short typological survey of each of them. When presenting the phonological systems, he pointed to the existence of the diphthongs /ay/ and /aw/ in Kanuri but did not mention their presence in Hausa! It is worth mentioning that according to the estimates (2005) Hausa might have been used by some 69 million speakers. The chapter ends with a concise historical background dealing mainly with the origins, spread, political and religious life and the present-day situation of the Hausa, Fulani and Kanuri people.

As far as the linguistic data are concerned, they are treated in the fourth chapter titled „Sammlung und Klassifikation der Daten" (pp. 24-29). The author's own data on Fulfulde, Kanuri and Hausa were collected during several field trips to northern Nigeria between October, 2002 and March, 2005. They are of two kinds: 1. sentences supplied by informants which display various semantic relations, and 2. free interviews with native speakers on various topics like politics,

football and traditions. To the second source of information belong numerous grammars and vocabularies of those three languages: in this respect the Hausa grammar by Ph. Jaggar proved to be very useful. Such manner of the collection of linguistic data was named „combined method" (*kombinierte Methode* - p. 24). Further on the reader will find a discussion on the definition of the adverbial clause and the adverbial subordinator. Special attention has been paid to the „ideal" adverbial subordinators as proposed by B. Kortmann who based his findings on the European languages.

B. Kortmann had singled out 32 semantic relations which have been taken over by B. Ziegelmeyer as a „working classification" in the fifth chapter „Adverbiale Relationen im Hausa, Fulfulde und Kanuri" (pp. 30-176). There is no need to add that it constitutes the main part of the study, in which the possibilities and means of expression of the semantic relations between clauses are meticulously analysed. These relations have been divided into four groups: 1. temporal, causal, and conditional relations, 2. concessive and related interclausal relations, 3. modal relations, and 4. other relations (those which do not belong to any of the three groups). Each semantic relation (e.g. simultaneity overlap, anteriority, condition, manner, concomitance etc.) is shortly defined and then investigated in Hausa, Fulfulde and Kanuri respectively. In few cases the Kortmann's semantic relations have been supplemented by additional ones like immediate posteriority, real condition, counterfactual condition, hypothetical concessive condition and universal concessive condition. At the end of the chapter (pp. 169-176) there is an inventory of the means which serve to express various adverbial relations.

At the beginning of the sixth chapter, „Adverbiale Subordinatoren" (pp. 177-194), the author identifies the 'ideal' adverbial subordinators in languages under discussion according to the criteria established by B. Kortmann and mentioned above. Then these subordinators are tested with regard to their form-function and form-meaning asymmetry. It has been pointed out that so called 'Inverse Relation Hypothesis' in reference to the adverbial subordinators of Hausa, Fulfulde and Kanuri could be fully justified. It is pertinent to keep it in mind that the author took special interest in such adverbial subordinators, which are uninflected free forms. They are 111 in number: Hausa 45, East Fulfulde 54, and Kanuri 14. In the final part

of the chapter G. Ziegelmeyer undertakes an effort aiming at the identification of the most common sources of the adverbial subordinators.

Aerial features of the adverbial subordination in Hausa are looked for in the relevant variants of Fulfulde and Kanuri in northern Nigeria. They have been identified and described in the seventh chapter titled „Areale Merkmale adverbialer Subordination" (pp. 195-228). In the first place such morphemes have been taken into account, which are attested at least in two of the three languages, and which are identical or similar in form and meaning. It appears from the Ziegelmeyer's analysis that such aerial features are eighteen in number: *amma*, *ban da*, *daa*, *daga/diga*, *daliil*, *don*, *gamaa*, *har/haa/hatta*, *kaafin* and *kawu?*, *kaman*, *koo*, *maimakon*, *sā'a*, *sabab*, *sai*, *t-k-n*, *tun/tun da* and *waqt*.

In the final chapter, „Schluss" (pp. 229f.), G. Ziegelmeyer points to a typological closeness between Hausa and Fulfulde, which is visible in the adverbial subordination, and which had earlier been discerned in many other language constructions. Kanuri represents quite different type of languages in this respect. If Hausa and Fulfulde make use of various clause-initial subordinators, Kanuri recurs to the subordinators placed at the end of the clause.

The book is provided with seventeen „linguistic" tables, eight maps and an exhaustive bibliography (pp. 231-240). It is an inspiring case-study with a socio-linguistic inclination.

Stanisław Piłaszewicz

Anbessa Teferra, Grover Hudson, *Essentials of Amharic*, Köln, Rüdiger Köppe Verlag, 2007, 254 pp.

According to the authors, the book is intended for a large spectrum of addressees, starting from adult learners of Amharic through the linguists up to the students of Ethiopian history and society (p. 9). Therefore, it is divided into four parts: History and Society (17 pp.), Grammar (115 pp.), Learn to read Amharic (41 pp.) and Wordlists (63 pp.).

Part 1, chapter 1 (pp. 11-28) offers information on other Ethiopian languages, the linguistic classification of Amharic, bilingualism in Ethiopia, Ethiopian language policy and Amharic literature, respectively. Worth noting here is table 1.2. (p. 17) with a list of ethno-linguistic groups, mother-tongue speakers and ethnic group members of Ethiopian languages, ordered by number of mother tongue speakers.

Part 2, chapter 2 (pp. 29-38) starts with a presentation of the Amharic sound system, continues with a short and comprehensive description on Amharic-specific elements and phenomena (consonant variants, labialization) and ends with tables of some possible writing systems for Amharic consonants and vowels (pp. 37f.). The last element is also a presentation of the transcription system used in the book, which follows International Phonetic Alphabet. In the chapter there is a section with Amharic vowels and their American English approximations (p. 34), which indicates the target group of the book, as well as table 2.4, showing the structures of one and two-syllable words with examples, very pragmatic in terms of the teaching/learning methodology. The phenomenon of long consonants has been presented in the chapter, being defined as something that "occurs in English, too, but only when like consonants come together in adjacent stressed syllables of different words" but has different spelling from English doubled consonants (p. 32). Chapter 3 on "Amharic words" (pp. 39-75) is designed pragmatically, as shown by subtitles, like "Nationality and language names" (p. 46), "Numerals and time" (p. 50), "To be about to do" (p. 68) or "Derived verbs in Amharic dictionaries" (p. 73). Similarly, it contains highly pragmatic information, such as a note on the demonstrative character of protruding lips in non-verbal Amharic (p. 50). Next to pragmatism, some structural linguistic reflections are ob-

servable. In a sub-chapter "Verbs derived from nouns" the authors suggest that denominal verbs probably exist in Amharic, although "denominal history is rarely certain" (p. 73). Chapter 4 (pp. 77-89) includes basic information on the Amharic sentence and gives a 12-pages description of the most complicated part of the Amharic language system. Compared to this, Chapter 5 (pp. 89-111) on Amharic writing is impressively elaborate; the data are broadly presented and pragmatically treated, with notes on similarities and differences between signs. The whole Part 2 is supplied with appendices (pp. 111-144), which have essential and valuable character for students of Amharic. The same concerns Part 3, "Learn to read Amharic" (pp. 145-186), undoubtedly being a result of a long teaching experience. The educational part of the book closes in Part 4 with Amharic-to-English and English-to-Amharic wordlists (pp. 187-250) including 1166 entries each. The words are proposed as the most frequent ones taught during a first-year college course. The index of topics and names placed at the end of the book (pp. 251-254) helps students to find the problem concerned.

Concluding on the material in Parts 2-4, I would say that only its specific and unconventional arrangement may prevent the book from being classified as a handbook. Therefore, this part appears to be something between a grammar and a handbook.

As my review is intended for American English speaking adult learners of Amharic, linguists and students of Ethiopian history and society, I must say that a large part of them will be satisfied. The data presented in the book is up-to-date and pragmatic, offering numerous references to the language of the addressee. The book is written in a simple language and refers to the contemporary linguistic realities of Ethiopia. On the linguistics level, the study offers some new perceptions and approaches to describing the Amharic language (transcription, gemination) and touches upon the very heart of essentiality. It is a product of and a material for teaching/learning Amharic, and, thanks to some grammatical and pragmatic notes, it might be an excellent starting point for further analysis in the field of applied linguistics, as well as for further exploration and description of the Amharic language.

Laura Łykowska

Holger Tröbs, Eva Rothmaler & Kerstin Winkelmann (eds), *La qualification dans les langues africaines*, „Topics in African Studies" 9, Köln 2008, Rüdiger Köppe Verlag, 2008, 258 pp.

This volume contains thirteen case-studies, which came into being as the result of an international project of the scientific co-operation between French (CNRS, INALCO, Paris 7) and German (Chair of African Studies at the Bayreuth University) institutions. The aim of the project was to investigate the question of qualification in African languages as indicated in its French („Typologie des adjectifs et de la qualification dans les langues africaines") and German („Eigenschaftskonzepte in westafrikanischen Sprachen") names.

The languages under scrutiny are spoken in Western and Central Africa and they represent different branches of the Niger-Congo and Nilo-Saharan phylum. Each article has been written by an author who is highly familiar with the respective language. The general aim of each case-study is to present in detail the qualification in the given language, then to describe the distribution of the qualification in different parts of speech, and finally to show the strategies of their attributive and predicative use. The authors try to determine if the language in question has a category of 'primary adjective' and whether the category of the adjective causes a problem.

In order to obtain comparable results the authors were obliged to make use of a list of 113 notions, some of which have been proposed by R.M.W. Dixon, and some others come from the field experience of the researchers (cf. appendix B on pp. 255-258 with glosses in French and English). In appendix A (pp. 211-254) there is a list of twelve concepts (e.g. dimension, age, colour, physical property etc.), which testify to the great variety of those notions in all the languages investigated in this book.

Each essay has been written according to the pre-established pattern: 1. introduction (language, typological features, parts of speech, problematic cases), 2. attributive use (primary adjectives, derived adjectives, participles, adverbs, ideophones, nouns, verbs, relative clauses, other), 3. predicative use (primary adjectives, derived adjectives, participles, adverbs, ideophones, nouns, quality verbs, other, experiencer constructions), 4. semantic observations, 5 discussion, and references at the end of the paper. In few cases this

schema has been somehow enlarged, e.g. in Dajo-Sila one can find a paragraph dealing with the adjectives of the Arabic origin.

The authors of this volume have adopted a strict definition of the 'primary adjective', the most important category in this study. Such adjective 1. should function as an epithet, 2. should not be conjugated, and 3. should not be the head of a syntagme.

The following languages have been taken into account:
I. Niger-Congo phylum: Bijogo (Atlantic language spoken in Guinea Bissau - presented by Guillaume Segerer), Wolof (Atlantic language spoken in Senegal, Gambia and Mauretania - Loïc Michel Perrin), Bambara (Mande language spoken in Mali - Holger Tröbs), Duun (Mande language spoken in Burkina Faso - Holger Tröbs), Jãäne (Gur language spoken in Burkina Faso - Gudrun Miehe), Kããsa (Gur language spoken in Burkina Faso - Gudrun Miehe), Naténi (Gur language spoken in Benin - Brigitte Nédellec), and Gbaya (Adamawa-Ubangi language spoken in Central African Republic - Paulette Roulon-Doko); II. Nilo-Saharan phylum: Kanuri (Saharan language as spoken in Nigeria - Eva Rothmaler), Bongo (Central Sudanic language spoken in Sudan - Pierre Nougayrol); Yulu (Central Sudanic language spoken in Sudan - Pascal Boyeldieu), Dajo-Sila (Eastern Sudanic language spoken in Sudan - Pascal Boyeldieu) and Songhay-Zarma (spoken in Niger - Oumarou Boukari).

The languages investigated in this book display some common tendencies. Apart from Wolof, that has no adjectives at all, this part of speech (especially derivative adjectives) is well represented in all the other languages under discussion. The primary adjectives are rather scarce in Bijogo (4), Duun (3), Naténi (2), and Bongo (3). On the other hand, Dajo-Sila has no derivative adjectives at all, while its 'primary adjectives' are quite numerous. In the Atlantic (Wolof, Bijogo) and Mande (Bambara, Duun) languages one of the most important qualification strategies is the use of the 'verbs of quality'. In Bambara, Naténi, Songhay-Zarma and others the qualification can be also assumed by the participles. In Kanuri, Songhay-Zarma and Yulu some qualities can be expressed by ideophones.

This inspirational study will be followed by another volume, which is being prepared for edition by B. Caron and D. Ibriszimow, and which is impatiently awaited.

Stanisław Piłaszewicz

Malin Petzell. *The Kagulu Language of Tanzania. Grammar, Texts and Vocabulary.* "East African Languages and Dialects", vol. 19, Köln: Rüdiger Köppe Verlag, 2008, 234 pp.

Petzell's book on Kagulu, based on the author's doctoral dissertation defended at the University of Gothenburg (2007), provides a valuable portrayal of this relatively unknown Bantu language spoken in the Morogoro region in Tanzania. The structure and depth of description parallels other reference grammars of its kind, with chapters on phonology, morphology and a brief sketch of syntax, but the book also contains a decent sociolinguistic background, several short texts with English glosses and translation, and a Kagulu-English word list. Given the low sociolinguistic status of Kagulu overwhelmed by the constant expansion of Swahili and a relatively small number of its speakers estimated at about 240 000 people only, the importance of Petzell's study lies not only in its being the first such detailed report of the language, but also in raising some interest in this minority tongue giving it a better chance for a longer survival and a better documentation.

The data have been collected by the author during several field trips to Tanzania between years 2002-2007 and have been elicited either in the form of questionnaires with sentences to translate from Swahili and English into Kagulu or from the spontaneous speech recorded during interviews including story-telling and reporting speakers' personal experience. The source material has been evidently plentiful and diversified so that the author could confidently exploit it in order to make general statements as to the language structure, as well as detailed remarks on various specific issues. All data are presented in a very clear and reader-friendly fashion: Kagulu examples are first given in the rough phonetic transcription, followed by a morphemic segmentation in the next line, then by English glosses and, finally, by an English equivalent. The author draws comparisons to Swahili, from which Kagulu extensively borrows, and to the neighbouring Bantu languages, but also to more distantly related contemporary Bantu languages or Proto-Bantu reconstructions when relevant for the discussion (e.g. the verb 'be bad' traced to a Proto-Bantu adjective on p. 80, or demonstrative pronouns on p. 88). Retrieving common Bantu ori-

gin of particular data of Kagulu and finding cross-linguistic paral-
lels makes reading of the book captivating and gratifying. At the
same time, such digressions are phrased in a very compact fashion
so that they do not disturb the smooth flow of the Kagulu facts.
Another point that has to be emphasized as a very good choice for
a novel, descriptive study is the organization of the data within an
apparatus called Basic Linguistic Theory which relies on funda-
mental concepts shared by various modern theories, but at the
same time avoids as much as possible the specific and possibly
confusing terminology associated with them. In this way, the book
is accessible to practically all linguists and not only those who are
familiar with a particular framework. This, of course, does not
mean that the description is atheoretical all together, because such
a thing is impossible and Petzell perfectly realizes it (cf. pp. 21f.).
Therefore, even though such terms as "underlying representations"
or "derivation" are nowhere mentioned, the concepts are present
throughout the book in morphemic analyses and processes de-
scribed; similarly, we can find the insights of Autosegmental Pho-
nology in the treatment of assimilation, but no talk of "autoseg-
ments" (e.g. on p. 38), etc. Due to such presentation, the reader can
concentrate on the language data, but the data themselves are well
organized because the "basic linguistic knowledge" underlies their
arrangement.

The study consists of six main chapters and a short conclu-
ding chapter 7, followed by Kagulu texts and a word list. There is
also a satisfactory subject index.

The introductory chapter 1 (pp. 17-33), in addition to the
usual information about the purpose of the study, methods used
etc., contains the results of a sociolinguistic survey of the Kagulu
area, which the author conducted herself. Its general purpose was
to determine the position of the language within the community by
investigating the degree of its competence among speakers, cir-
cumstances of communicating in Kagulu in contrast to Swahili and
people's attitude towards the use of their mother tongue. Petzell
concludes that even though some criteria determine Kagulu as an
endangered language (e.g. no literacy tradition, no support from
the government, vocabulary gaps), others do not (e.g. intergenera-

tional language transmission, high regard for Kagulu by its speakers), especially since the documentation of it is growing.

Chapter 2 on phonology (pp. 35-46) contains the basics of the segments' inventory and a brief discussion of morphophonological processes typical of Bantu languages, such as vowel coalescence, deletion and gliding, and vowel harmony. The author also pays some attention to a morphophonological process found in class 9/10 nouns which results in surfacing of voiceless nasals (pp. 38-40). On the whole, however, the chapter seems a little too concise, especially when compared to large chapters devoted to morphology. For example, the environments for the processes involving vowel hiatus' resolution could have been stated more precisely since apparently they apply in some morphological contexts only and not in others. A presumably complex prosodic pattern of Kagulu is only signalled (pp. 40f.), with rather vague statements as to tone (e.g. "there is probably phrasal tone and not lexical tone", p. 41) and not very convincing claims about stress (the examples of rather unusual "pre-antepenult" stress on p. 41could be perhaps cases of the initial stress). But, in the author's defence, it should be noted that examining prosodic patterns of Bantu languages usually requires an extended study of its own.

Morphology lies at the heart of the author's focus and is discussed in great detail. It occupies three chapters: chapter 3 on nominal morphology (pp. 47-95), chapter 4 on verbal morphology (pp. 97-147) and chapter 5 on uninflected parts of speech (pp. 149-154). All of them are very well organized and contain remarkable data. Although Kagulu resembles other Bantu languages in its general morphological structure, it has unique features of its own which can be of great interest to Bantuists. For example, section 3.2 on the so-called "initial vowel" (also called "augment" or "pre-prefix") particularly draws attention in the chapter on nominal morphology. Unlike in many other Bantu languages in which the use of the morpheme is common to the extent that represents an unmarked case, the use of the initial vowel in Kagulu is apparently purposeful and governed by a number of syntactic, semantic and pragmatic functions, such as definiteness, specificity or topicality. There also seems to be a variation among speakers and, possibly, among generations, with younger speakers showing less tendency

for using it than the older ones, which goes against the general Bantu tendency, but can be explained by the Swahili influence. In the chapter on verbal morphology, a rich array of tense/aspect markers (TAM) is worthy of note as some of them clearly represent Kagulu innovations, e.g. the past marker *ha* occurring in an unusual pre-subject marker position. The author makes a rigid distinction between inflectional morphemes (including TAM) and derivational morphemes known in the Bantuist tradition as "extensions". It is perhaps a little controversial that under Petzell's account the passive marker *igw* and the imperfective (habitual) suffix *ag* fall into the former class, while, for example, the so-called "neuter" *ik/ek* marker goes into the latter class. Perhaps a better solution would be to treat all these morphemes as extensions with the assumption of the inflection-derivation continuum, especially since the "proper" extensions seem to have an unequal status, too, showing different degrees of productivity and lexicalization.

Chapter 6 on syntax (pp. 155-190), although not very extensive, is quite adequate and informative. In addition to the basic phrase and clause structure, it contains discussions of various kinds of complex sentences (including relative and complement clauses), locative and existential structures, imperatives and hortatives, as well as interrogative and exclamatory clauses. Various facts appear particularly interesting in the Kagulu syntax and Petzell's presentation surely encourages their further exploration, e.g. locative and subject/object inversion or relative clauses of two types.

The short chapter 7 *Concluding remarks* (pp. 191-193), in addition to a brief summary of the goals and results of the work, contains the author's thoughtful proposals for further research on Kagulu. *Kagulu texts* (pp. 194-208) comprise three short stories spontaneously told by Kagulu speakers and an additional short text translated from Swahili. As other language material in the book, the texts are also very carefully analysed morphologically and provide good examples of the data in a larger context.

Petzell's book undoubtfully offers an excellent description of Kagulu which will hopefully advance further research on this language to the advantage of Bantu linguistic studies and for the benefit of the Kagulu people and their culture.

Iwona Kraska-Szlenk

STUDIES OF THE DEPARTMENT OF AFRICAN LANGUAGES AND CULTURES

published so far: